

International Journal of Korean Studies

Volume XIV, Number 2 • Fall/Winter 2010

The United States and the Origins of the Korean War:
The Failure of Deterrence

The Causes of the Korean War, 1950-1953

Chinese Perspectives on the Origins of the Korean War:
An Assessment at Sixty

The Role and Responsibilities of the United States in the Korean War:
Critical Foreign Policy Decisions
by the Truman and Eisenhower Administrations

The Role and Responsibilities of China and
the Former Soviet Union in the Korean War

From Korea to Vietnam: The Evolution of U.S. Interventionism in Asia

The Korean Position on Alliance Formation and the Change of
Public Trust between Korea and the United States:
The *Cheonan* Incident and the OPCON Issue

The Impact of the Korean War on the
Political-Economic System of North Korea

**International Council on Korean Studies
Council on Korea-U.S. Security Studies**

**International Journal of
KOREAN STUDIES**

**Volume XIV Number 2
Fall/Winter 2010**

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF KOREAN STUDIES

Volume XIV, Number 2 (Fall/Winter 2010)

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Hugo Wheegook Kim, *East-West Research Institute*

MANAGING EDITOR

Jack L. Hammersmith, *West Virginia University*

Editorial Assistant: Donna MacIsaac

EDITORS

Kwang Soo Cheong, *Johns Hopkins Univ.*
Uk Heo, *University of Wisconsin- Milw*
Nam-Sung Huh, *Korea National Defense Univ.*
Young Whan Kihl, *Iowa State University*
Young-Key Kim-Renaud, *George Wash. U.*
Hong Nack Kim, *West Virginia University*
Ilpyong J. Kim, *University of Connecticut*
Jinill Kim, *Federal Reserve System*

Samuel S. Kim, *Columbia University*
Haeduck Lee, *The World Bank*
Jin Young Park, *American University*
Yoon-shik Park, *George Wash. University*
Hang Yul Rhee, *Shepherd University*
Terence J. Roehrig, *U.S. Naval War*
Dennis Roy, *East-West Center (Honolulu)*
Jai P. Ryu, *Loyola College*

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Yong-Ho Choe, *University of Hawaii*
Bruce Cumings, *University of Chicago*
Wonmo Dong, *University of Washington*
Carter Eckert, *Harvard University*
Hak-joon Kim, *The Dong-A Ilbo*
Han Kyo Kim, *University of Cincinnati*
Jae-Chang Kim, *Korea-U.S. Security Studies*
Youn-Suk Kim, *Kean University*
Chae-Jin Lee, *Claremont-McKenna College*
Marcus Noland, *Inst. for Intl. Economics*
Edward A. Olsen, *Naval Post Grad. School*

Soon Paik, *U.S. Department of Labor*
Jong O. Ra, *Hollins U. and Virginia*
Jae Kap Ryoo, *Kyonggi University*
Eui-Hang Shin, *University of South Carol*
David I. Steinberg, *Georgetown University*
Robert G. Sutter, *Georgetown University*
William J. Taylor, Jr., *CSIS & Georgetown*
Richard W. Wilson, *Rutgers University*
Yong Soon Yim, *Sungkyunkwan Univ*
Jang H. Yoo, *Ehwa Women's University*
Young Kwan Yoon, *Seoul Natl. University*

EDITORIAL INFORMATION

Contributors should submit one copy of the paper that is 20 - 35 pages in length, double-spaced, 12 point font with one-inch margins and endnotes accompanied by an electronic file compatible with the current version of MS Word. Unpublished original papers must provide full documentation in conformance with the standards in the current edition of the *Chicago Manual of Style*. Papers are to be submitted to Dr. Hugo W. Kim, Editor-in-Chief, *International Journal of Korean Studies*, 14641 Lee Highway, Suite 208, Centreville, VA 20121-5822, U.S.A. Contact: Tel (703) 266-3245, Fax (703) 266-3865, and E-mail at hugo33kim@vacoxmail.com

The *International Journal of Korean Studies* is indexed and abstracted in the references of major social sciences, and all of its articles are accessible through the Columbia International Affairs Online by the Columbia University Press and Asia-Studies Online.

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF KOREAN STUDIES

Volume XIV, Number 2

Fall/Winter 2010

Contents

The United States and the Origins of the Korean War: The Failure of Deterrence	William W. Stueck, Jr.	1
The Causes of the Korean War, 1950-1953	Chang Il Ohn	19
Chinese Perspectives on the Origins of the Korean War: An Assessment at Sixty	Steven M. Goldstein	45
The Role and Responsibilities of the United States in the Korean War: Critical Foreign Policy Decisions by the Truman and Eisenhower Administrations	Doug Bandow	71
The Role and Responsibilities of China and the Former Soviet Union in the Korean War	Byong Moo Hwang	101
From Korea to Vietnam: The Evolution of U.S. Interventionism in Asia	Mel Gurtov	127
The Korean Position on Alliance Formation and the Change of Public Trust between Korea and the United States: The <i>Cheonan</i> Incident and the OPCON Issue	Taewoo Kim	147
The Impact of the Korean War on the Political-Economic System of North Korea	Scott A. Snyder and Joyce Lee	161

The International Journal of Korean Studies is copyrighted under U.S. law.
© 2010 International Council on Korean Studies

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF KOREAN STUDIES

The *International Journal of Korean Studies* (IJKS) is published twice a year jointly by the International Council on Korean Studies (ICKS) and the Council on Korea-U.S. Security Studies (COKUSS). Annual Subscription Rates: \$35 for individual subscriptions, and \$60 for institutional and international subscriptions. All the members of ICKS are entitled to receive the journal automatically, and all issues of IJKS are posted on the ICKS website at <http://www.icks.org/publication/index.html>.

Contact: International Council on Korean Studies (ICKS)
14641 Lee Highway, Suite 208, Centreville, VA 20121-5822, U.S.A.
Tel (703) 266-3245, Fax (703) 266-3865, E-mail at hugo33kim@vacoxmail.com
ICKS Website Home: <http://www.icks.org>

INTERNATIONAL COUNCIL ON KOREAN STUDIES (ICKS)

ICKS is a non-profit and non-partisan organization dedicated to the advancement of Korean studies and related academic and professional activities in the United States as well as abroad through conferences, publications, and other relevant activities.

EXECUTIVE BOARD

President: Soon Paik
Vice Presidents: Jae O. Kang and Richard T. Shin
Secretary General: Kwang Soo Cheong, Treasurer: Won Eok Kim
IJKS Editor-in-Chief: Hugo Wheegook Kim

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Chairman: Hong Nack Kim, Vice Chairman: Lai-Sung Kim
Members: Bruce E. Bechtol, Jr., Kwang Soo Cheong, Walter Choi, Young Back Choi, Uk Heo, Soon Kyung Hong, Yong Hwangbo, Dong-Keun Jeong, Pilju Kim Joo, Jae O. Kang, Young Whan Kihl, Hugo Wheegook Kim, Ilpyong J. Kim, Kinney H. Kim, Se Ung Kim, Ung Soo Kim, Youn-Suk Kim, Haeduck Lee, Woong B. Lee, Soon Paik, Yoon-shik Park, Jong O. Ra, Hang Yul Rhee, Steve Y. Rhee, Terence J. Roehrig, Jai P. Ryu, Eui Hang Shin, Richard T. Shin
AUDITORS: Jaewoo Lee and Seon-Young Ahn

COUNCIL ON KOREA-U.S. SECURITY STUDIES (COKUSS)

The Council on Korea-U.S. Security Studies was established in 1984 as a not-for-profit organization by a group of retired military officers, diplomats, and scholars from the United States and Korea. The Council aims to promote studies on political, economic, and military relations between two countries by exchanges of opinions and ideas among theorists and practitioners through conferences and publications.

EXECUTIVE BOARD

Co-Chairman: John H. Tilelli, Jr. and Jae-Chang Kim
Directors: Jae-Kap Ryoo, Hugo Wheegook Kim, and Nam-Sung Huh

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Co-Chairman: John H. Tilelli, Jr. and Jae-Chang Kim
Members: Jong-Chun Baek, Nam-Sung Huh, Kwang-On Hyun, Il Hwa Jung, Hee-Sang Kim, Yong-Ok Park, Jae-Kap Ryoo, Yong Soon Yim, Raymond P. Ayres, Jr., Bruce E. Bechtol, Jr., Hugo Wheegook Kim, Patrick M. Morgan
AUDITORS: Taewoo Kim and Dae-Sung Song

CONTRIBUTORS

Doug Bandow is a Senior Fellow at the Cato Institute. He also is the Robert A. Taft Fellow at the American Conservative Defense Alliance and the Cobden Fellow in International Economics at the Institute for Policy Innovation. He served as a Special Assistant to President Ronald Reagan and as a senior policy analyst in the 1980 Reagan for President campaign. He has been widely published in periodicals such as *Time*, *Newsweek*, *Fortune*, *Christianity Today*, and *Foreign Policy*, as well as leading newspapers including the *New York Times*, *Wall Street Journal*, and *Washington Post*. He currently is a regular contributor to the Huffington Post, National Interest online, and American Spectator online. Bandow has written and edited several books, including *Foreign Follies: America's New Global Empire* (Xulon Press), *The Korean Conundrum: America's Troubled Relations with North and South Korea* (Palgrave/Macmillan, coauthor), *Tripwire: Korea and U.S. Foreign Policy in a Changed World* (Cato), *Perpetuating Poverty: The World Bank, the IMF, and the Developing World* (Cato, coeditor), and *The Politics of Plunder: Misgovernment in Washington* (Transaction). He received his B.S. in Economics from Florida State University in 1976 and his J.D. from Stanford University in 1979.

Steven M. Goldstein received his Ph.D from Columbia University. Since 1968 he has been a member of the Government Department at Smith College. In 1998 he was named the Sophia Smith Professor of Government. Goldstein is the Director of the Taiwan Studies Workshop at Harvard University and an Associate of the Asia Center. He has been a visiting faculty member at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy and Columbia University. From 1983 to 1984 he was the Director of the China Council of the Asia Society in New York. His research interest has been largely related to issues of Chinese domestic and foreign policy. Goldstein has published studies of Sino-American relations; Sino-Soviet relations; the emergence of a Chinese Communist view of world affairs; and the reform process in post-Mao China. His current research focus is on the relations between the mainland and Taiwan as well as the evolution of U.S.-Taiwan relations. He has written, co-authored or edited nine books as well as many scholarly articles and book reviews.

Mel Gurtov is Professor Emeritus of Political Science at Portland State University, Oregon. Currently, he is Visiting Professor of Political Science at the University of Oregon, Eugene and Director of the Institute for Asian Studies at Portland State. He is also Editor-in-Chief of *Asian Perspective*, a position he has held since 1994. Gurtov previously served

on the research staff of the RAND Corporation in Santa Monica, Calif. (1966-71), where he was a co-author of the Pentagon Papers, and at the University of California, Riverside (1971-86), where he was professor of political science. He has published twenty books and numerous articles on East Asian affairs, U.S. foreign policy, and global politics, all from a human-security viewpoint. His most recent books are *Superpower on Crusade: The Bush Doctrine in US Foreign Policy* (Lynne Rienner, 2006) and *Global Politics in the Human Interest*, 5th ed. (Lynne Rienner, 2007). Gurtov has been a visiting professor and Senior Fulbright Scholar—at Waseda University in Tokyo and Hankuk Foreign Studies University in Seoul—and he has lectured at universities and research institutes in South Korea, Japan, and China.

Byong Moo Hwang is emeritus professor of strategic studies at Korea National Defense University, Seoul, Korea. He is editor-in-chief of *The Korean Journal of International Relations*. He was president, the Korean Association of International Studies (1995). He has also been a visiting scholar at the RAND Corporation in Santa Monica, California.. He has worked for the President of the ROK as chairman of the National Defense Advisory Council (2005-2008) and a member of the National Unification Advisory Committee(2006-2008). Dr. Hwang is the author of numerous books and articles on the security policies of Korea and China, including *Korea,s Security: Scope, Debates, and Policies* (2d ed., 2009), and *ROK's Defense Reform and Security Diplomacy*, both in Korean. Previously, he collaborated with Mel Gurtov on *China under Threat* and *China's Security*, which has a Korean edition.

Taewoo Kim received the Ph. D. in Political Science from the State University of New York at Buffalo in 1989. Since then he has worked as a defense specialist with special interest in nuclear issues. Currently Dr. Kim is vice-president in charge of the Defense Affairs Committee at the Korea Institute for Defense Analyses (KIDA). He is author of some 700 writings (books, papers, and newspaper columns) pertaining to nuclear matters. His writings written in English include: "US-DPRK Nuclear Rapprochement in the South Korean Dilemmas," *Third World Quarterly* (Nov. 1995); "South Korean Patience Wearing Thin," *Bulletin of Atomic Scientists* (Sept.-Oct. 1995); "South Korea's Missile Dilemmas," *Asian Survey* (May-June 1999); "Islamic Terrorism and Clash of Civilizations," *Korean Journal of Defense Analyses* (Mar. 2002); "North Korean Nuclear Politics at the Crossroads," *KJDA* (Fall 2004).

Chang Il Ohn (Ph.D., University of Kansas) has taught military history, the world and Korea, and introduction to strategy at the Korea Military Academy since 1983, and is also on security and strategic affairs at the

Sanji University, Korea. He served as Director, Division of Humanities and Social Sciences, Registrar, and Director, Division of Academic Affairs at the Korea Military Academy. He also served as Research Director of the Korean Association of International Studies (1989), President of the Korean Association of Korean War Studies (2004-5), Military History (2007). His publications include *History of Wars in Korea* (Korean, 2001), *A Study on Strategy* (Korean, 2004), *A Study on War* (Korean, 2007), and *World Military History* (co-authored Korean, 2005), in addition to many articles.

Scott A. Snyder is Director of the Center for U.S.-Korea Policy at The Asia Foundation and a Senior Associate at Pacific Forum CSIS. He is also the Adjunct Senior Fellow for Korean Studies at the Council on Foreign Relations and is based in Washington, DC. He lived in Seoul, South Korea as Korea Representative of The Asia Foundation during 2000-2004. Previously, he served as a Program Officer in the Research and Studies Program of the U.S. Institute of Peace, and as Acting Director of The Asia Society's Contemporary Affairs Program. His latest book, *China's Rise and the Two Koreas: Politics, Economics, Security*, was published by Lynne Rienner in 2009. His publications include *Paved With Good Intentions: The NGO Experience in North Korea* (2003), co-edited with L. Gordon Flake and *Negotiating on the Edge: North Korean Negotiating Behavior* (1999). Snyder received his B.A. from Rice University and an M.A. from the Regional Studies East Asia Program at Harvard University.

William Stueck (Ph.D., Brown University, 1977) is Distinguished Research Professor of History at the University of Georgia, where he has taught since 1982. In 1995 he was a Senior Fulbright Scholar at Hankuk University of Foreign Studies in Seoul, South Korea. He has published numerous journal articles and chapters in book collections on the Korean War and U.S.-Korean relations, and is currently writing a topical history of the latter topic. His best-known books are *The Korean War: An International History* (Princeton, 1995) and *Rethinking the Korean War: A New Diplomatic and Strategic History* (Princeton, 2002).