

# LAW AND WAR



# LAW AND WAR



*An American Story*

PETER MAGUIRE



COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY PRESS • NEW YORK

*Columbia University Press*  
*Publishers Since 1893*  
*New York Chichester, West Sussex*

Copyright © 2001 Columbia University Press

All rights reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Maguire, Peter H.

Law and war: an American story / Peter Maguire.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-231-12050-8 (cloth) — ISBN 0-231-12051-6 (paper)

1. War crimes. 2. War (International law). 3. Nuremberg War Crime Trials, Nuremberg, Germany, 1946-1949. 4. United States—Foreign relations—20th century. I. Title.

K5301 .M34 2000

341.6'9—dc21

00-031442



Columbia University Press books are printed on permanent and durable acid-free paper.

Printed in the United States of America

c 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

p 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

*This book is dedicated to the memories of  
Telford Taylor (1908–1999),  
Marty Hoey (1951–1982),  
Robert Ross (1955–1999),  
and the very much alive  
James Patrick Shenton.*



## *Contents*



### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS *ix*

### Introduction *i*

1. The End of Limited War *19*
2. The Changing Rules of War and Peace *47*
3. The American War Crimes Program *101*
4. A Shift in Priorities *145*
5. Nuremberg: A Cold War Conflict of Interest *203*
6. The War Criminals and the Restoration  
of West German Sovereignty *235*

### Conclusion *283*

### NOTES *291*

### GLOSSARY *393*

### BIBLIOGRAPHY *397*

### INDEX *423*



## *Acknowledgments*



I began this book as a junior at Bard College in 1986 at the prompting of German history professor John Fout, who encouraged me to find out more about my great-grandfather's tenure as a judge at the Nuremberg trials. Others at Bard College who were supportive in the early years of this project include: Robert Koblitz, Peter Skiff, Mark Lytle, Karen Greenberg, William Preston, Leon Botstein, Sanjeb Baruah, and the late Mary McCarthy.

I continued my research on the Nuremberg trials as a graduate student in history at Columbia University, where I was very fortunate to be assigned James Patrick Shenton as my advisor. Jim guided me through the political minefields of contemporary academia with the wisdom and *sangfroid* that he gained on the battlefields of Europe during World War II. Whether it was from a hospital bed or on the road guiding historical tours, Jim made time for me, and I will always be grateful.

Another individual who played a key role in this project was the late Nuremberg prosecutor Telford Taylor. For more than a decade, Telford made himself available for interviews and casual conversations. He

allowed me to attend his laws of war class at Columbia Law School. Most of all, I was inspired by Telford Taylor's intellectual courage. Whether he was attacking Joseph McCarthy at West Point or telling North Vietnamese leaders that they too were committing war crimes during a wartime visit to Hanoi, Telford Taylor called them as he saw them, irrespective of the political consequences. While we didn't agree on some things, in the end he supported and encouraged this study long after others had given up on it. Telford died in May 1998, but his life's work and memory live on. I only wish that he could have lived to see the publication of this book, as he was working on a similar one when he died. Jonathan Bush, Telford Taylor's biographer, was also extremely helpful, and I owe him a great debt for his helpful and constructive criticism.

Anders Stephanson was my most important intellectual advisor in graduate school and beyond. In an age of academic microspecialization, I was extremely fortunate to study under someone whose intellectual repertoire is both broad and deep. Anders helped me to make sense of the vast literature on war and statecraft and in the process to see how American policy broke from European tradition. He never lost faith in my work, and for this I will always be grateful. Others I would like to thank for various forms of support and inspiration at Columbia include: Ron Grele, John Danaher, Mary Marshall, Ed O'Donnell, Walter Friedman, Dan Hulsebosch, Gordon Spencer, Ken Jackson, and James Chace.

I would like to thank Lydia Wills of the Artists Agency for her early support of my work and her efforts on my behalf. I had an opportunity to examine West German disdain for the Nuremberg trials and the importance of the Cold War on American war crimes policy more closely after graduate school. In 1995 I was hired by documentary film producer Robert Ross to work on a German documentary about Nuremberg's IMT produced by Bengt von zur Mühlen of Chronos Films and Michael Kloft of Spiegel TV in 1995. I spent a large part of the summer of 1995 in Berlin working with German war crimes scholar Jörg Friedrich. This study was greatly enriched by the time that I spent in Berlin with Friedrich and Kloft in the summers of 1995 and 1996. Without the help of Robert Ross, Michael Kloft, Jörg Friedrich, and Otto Kranzbühler, my book would be significantly less thorough and I would have passed over a number of unpleasant realities about Nuremberg and West Germany. I would also like to thank Martin Splichal and Johanna Sophia for helping me translate a number of German secondary sources.

The American Nuremberg trial participants generously gave of their time. Former IMT and subsequent proceedings prosecutor, author of one of the most comprehensive studies of the international trial (*Inside the Nuremberg Trial*), Drexel Sprecher, was very helpful over many years. William Caming helped me to get a better sense of my great-grandfather and his role in the Ministries case. Walter Rockler candidly described the impact of the Cold War on the trial. Ben Ferencz helped me learn more about John McCloy's Peck Panel and forced me to reconsider some of my early and more simplistic views on John McCloy. The late Robert Kempner was also helpful in the earlier stages of this project. A number of my great-grandfather's former legal associates helped me to get to know Robert Maguire, the man. Thanks to Alfred Hampsten, Randolph Kester, and James Brand Jr. Judge Maguire's children were also extremely helpful in locating his letters from Germany. Betty Frankus, Connie and Joseph Wilson, and Robert Maguire Jr. all greatly added to my understanding of my great-grandfather and his experience in Nuremberg. My uncle Gil Maguire also read numerous drafts and offered very constructive criticism.

The students in my seminar on the law and theory of war at Columbia University also helped me to distill my ideas on law and war. A special thanks goes to William Gouveia, Dan McDorman, Greg Lembrich, David Van Geyzel, and Brit West. In the fall of 1995, I gave a paper at the Carnegie Council on Ethics and International Affairs, and benefited from the comments of Barton Bernstein and Akira Iriye. I was fortunate to be placed on a panel with Lt. Col. Conrad Crane of West Point, who taught me a great deal about bombing the professional military's view of the laws of war. Conrad introduced me to Lt. Col. Gary Solis, who read an earlier draft of this book and greatly increased my knowledge of and appreciation for the professional military's views of law, war, duty, and honor. My work has been greatly enriched by my interaction with America's professional soldiers.

In 1998, Susan Gillespie and Leon Botstein invited me to host a conference at Bard College entitled "Accounting for Atrocities Fifty Years After Nuremberg." I would like to thank Bard and all the conference participants. A special thanks goes to Jörg Friedrich, Jonathan Bush, Richard Goldstone, Conrad Crane, and Chinua Achebe for their particularly inspired papers.

I want to express my gratitude to the many scholars, lawyers, and journalists who read and commented on parts or all of this study over the last

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

decade: Ron Steel, Brian DiSalvatore, William Finnegan, Ron Olson, Werner Koenig, Thomas Schwartz, Marc Trachtenberg, John Willand, and Michael Coles. A special thanks goes to Bob Primeaux, an enrolled member of the Standing Rock Sioux tribe and a traditional Elder of the Hunkpapa Treaty Council. Our discussions in the summer of 1999 greatly added to my knowledge of America's Indian Wars.

Others who helped more than they will ever know: Mike Cundith, George Greenough, Anthony Edgeworth, Ian Warner, and Mike Perry.

I owe a special debt to Mark, Dotty, and Fritz Johnson of Portland, Oregon, who provided me with a bit of peace and quiet and a place to write on the Oregon coast in 1992 and 1993. Seaside Point and Chris Cowan—generosity I will always be grateful for. Frank Opperman and Mary Kennedy were also extremely helpful in the final stages of the book. I would also like to thank Kate Wittenberg and James Burger of Columbia University Press for their help. To my editors, Rebecca McLennan and Leslie Kriesel, thank you for your patience and perseverance.

My parents, Joan Tewkesbury and Robert Maguire, both generously supported me and this project. Finally, to my wife, Annabelle Lee, whose unconditional love, faith, and support made the completion of this book possible.

# LAW AND WAR

