

---

## Notes

### *1. On Proxy Wars and Surrogate Victims*

1. These and other such expressions are all titles of books or articles written on Lebanon. See for example, Barakat 1977; Binder 1966; Gordon 1980; Hudson 1968; Meo 1965; Shills 1966.
2. The writings of the so-called “founding fathers” of the Lebanese Republic and some of their chauvinistic philosophers abound with such idyllic expressions. See, for example, Al-Hajj 1961; Chiha 1966; Habachi 1960; Malik 1974. President Amin Gemayyel during his blustering term in office (1982–1988) repeatedly invoked in several of his speeches the notion of ‘*unfuwan* — a distinguishing trait or state of mind which combines attributes such as vigor, aggressiveness resourcefulness and sense of pride. In his view, it was ‘*unfuwan* that accounts for the resilience and steadfastness of the Lebanese in resisting the persisting hardships and threats to their national sovereignty. It is also ‘*unfuwan* that will ultimately redeem them in regenerating and reconstructing Lebanon’s enfeebled institutions.
3. For an elaboration of Lebanon’s precarious and problematic foreign policy and its implications for exacerbating the inside-outside dialectics see, among others, the following: Azar 1984; Buheiry 1989; Gerges 1994, 1997; Hitti 1989; Salem 1993 and 1994; Stookey 1979.
4. Public opinion in Lebanon, incidentally, was not particularly pleased by the analogy. Religious figures were particularly incensed that Lebanon should be treated as a paragon for the ethnic cleansing and bloody confrontations accompanying the dismemberment of the Soviet Union (See Al-Nahar, April 26, 1994).
5. For a sample of these and other related views see: Farsoun and Wingarter 1981:

93–106; Fisk 1990; Gilmour 1983: 86–96; Hudson 1978: 261–278; Petran 1987: 142–84; Randal 1984: 61–108; Sirriyyeh 1967: 73–89.

6. See Nawaf Salam's (1979) exhaustive annotated bibliography of references and sources.
7. The Recent book of Irene Gendzier (1997) and earlier essays of 1988, 1989, and 1990 are very instructive and enlightening.

## 2. *The Radicalization of Communal Loyalties*

1. There has been a profusion of writing recently exploring various dimensions of the globalization of ethnic and communal violence. Interested readers may wish to consult the following: Barber 1996; Brezezinski 1993; Esman and Rabinovich 1988; Geyer 1985; Hanf 1995; Ignatieff 1994; Kakar 1996; Kelly 1994; Moynihan 1993; Wriston 1992.
2. For a representative cross-section of the literature see Almond and Coleman 1960; Almond and Powell 1966; Apter 1965; Eisenstadt 1966; Lerner 1962; Pye 1966; Shils 1965;
3. Substantive and persuasive evidence can be extracted from a score of studies in support of such views. See, among others, Chevallier 1971; Harik 1968; Khalaf 1979; Picard 1996; Salibi 1965.

## 3. *The Drift into Incivility*

1. The assassination attempt on Schlomo Argov, the Israeli Ambassador, was incidentally the works of Abu Nidal the most bitter rival of the PLO.
2. For further documentation see Winslow 1996
3. For a probing analysis of this violent legacy and its implications for present-day belligerent identity and communal strugglers, see Regina Schwartz 1997.

## 5. *Civil Strife of 1958: Revolt and Counter Revolt*

1. The war, incidentally, goes under a variety of labels; reflecting the wide range of perceptions it provoked among participants and observers. The following stand out: "insurgency," "rebellion," "insurrection," "sedition," "armed resistance," "disturbances," "cauldron." In addition, there are more sensational terms, such as "Revolt of the Pashas" and "Midsummer Madness."
2. Since its inception the 1958 crisis has generated an endless stream of writing; both by local and foreign scholars. In addition to sources cited here, interested readers may wish to consult Nawaf Salam (1979) for an exhaustive annotated bibliography of references and sources pertinent to various dimensions of the crisis. The role of the U.S. and its intervention, largely ignored in this discussion, has also been the object of extensive writing and speculation. Declassified

documents have recently renewed interest in reexamining U.S. perceptions and policy. See, in particular, the instructive essays and book Irene Gendzier has recently published (1988 1989 1990 and 1997).

3. Items were extracted for chronologies in *Middle East Journal* (Vol. 11, 12, 13), *Middle Eastern Affairs* (Vols. 8, 9, 10). Interested readers may wish to consult United National Observation Group in Lebanon (UNOGIL), *Report* (N.Y. Security Council Document S/4040 1958), Annex C, and speeches and replies by Dr. Charles Malik and Mr. Lutfi before Security Council (June 6 and 10, 1958) in Qubain (1961: 181–224).
4. Ibid.
5. Since its establishment in 1878, the Maqassed had been one of the most viable Sunni Muslim benevolent associations with extensive cultural, educational, and welfare activities. The Salam family, particularly Saeb, has skillfully patronized the association to extend the popular base of his political clientage.
6. For texts of Dr. Charles Malik and Mr. Umar Lutfi, UAR's delegate to the U.N., U.N. resolutions and other supportive evidence, see Qubain 1961: 181–235; Agwani 1963: 335–340.
7. Malki was a prominent Ba'thist and assistant to Syrian Chief of Staff. For an account of the "Malki affair," see Seale 1965: 238–246.
8. Mughabghab was eventually assassinated on a visit to the Chuf on July 27 1959.

#### 6. Lebanon's Golden/Gilded Age: 1943–1975

1. Examples of such writing one legion. The following are just a few readers may wish to consult: Ajami 1988; Barakat 1977; Kliot 1987; Mackey 1989; Odeh 1985; Rabinovich 1985; Randal 1984; Rouleau 1975; Shmesh 1986.
2. For a critical assessment of this notion and its advocates, see Nabih Faris (1960).
3. The prerequisites Professor Issawi considers include factors such as size of territory and population; a high per capita income; an equal distribution of wealth; a large proportion of the population engaged in industry and services; a high degree of national, linguistic, and religious homogeneity; widespread education and a capacity for voluntary cooperative action (see Issawi 1964: 279).
4. The "New Phoenicians" is the self-assigned label of a close circle of liberal-minded and mostly Christian bourgeoisie, who were instrumental in shaping the economic and political future of Lebanon shortly after independence. The most ideological and most prominent mentor of the groups is, of course, Michel Chiha (President Khoury's brother-in-law) who evolved into something of a public intellectual, the regime's gadfly, testing platform and moral conscience. Other influential members of the circle included Gabriel Menassa, Henri Pharaon, Alfred Kettaneh and Philip Taqla (for further details see Gates 1998: 82–89).
5. Fuad Shihab's close circle of advisors was a more mixed and heterogeneous

group of military and civilians, Lebanese and French professionals and technocrats: Louise-Joseph Lebreton (Jesuit priest), Jean Lay (military engineer), Elias Sarkis, Georges Haimari, Shafik Muharram. Like those of Khoury-Chiha they were also committed, albeit a bit more moderately, to the ideals of liberal democracy (see Winslow 1996: 137).

6. For a systematic and well-documented elaboration of some of these abusive features, see Baalbaki 1973; Lebanese Communist Party 1973; Nasr 1978.
7. A 1974 survey of the largest industrial firms of the eastern suburbs of Beirut, showed that 28 percent of the wage earners were employed for less than one year. An equal proportion had worked in the same enterprise for more than five years, and the remaining 44 percent between one to five years (Nasr 1978: 11).
8. I can name only a few here in passing: Asad Rustum, Constantine Zurayk, Zeine Zeine and Nabih Fares in History, Jibrail Jabbur, Anis Frayha and Kamal Yazigi in Arabic; Charles Malik in Philosophy; Said Hamadeh and Husni Sawwaf in Business Administration; Albert Badre and George Hakim in Economics; Habib Kurani, George Shahla and Jibrail Katul in Education; Nikula Shahine in Physics; Aziz Abdul-Karim and Adib Sarkis in Chemistry; Philip Ashkar, Henry Badeer, Dikran Berberian, Hrant Chaglassian, George Fawaz, Sami Haddad, Amin Khairallah, Mustafa Khalidi, Nimeh Nucho, Philip Sahyoun and Hovsep Yenikomashian in Medicine; Charles Abou-Chaar and Amin Haddad in Pharmacy.
9. The interested reader should consult the invaluable work of Suha Tamim (ed.), *A Bibliography of AUB Faculty Publications, 1866–1966* (Beirut 1967).
10. The following is a partial list just by way of indicating the magnitude of those who were actively engaged in producing the research output emanating from this group of scholars. The names were extracted from journals like *Travaux de Jours*, *Mélange*, *Annales*, and *Proche Orient*, where many of their publications appeared: Selim Abou, Tanios Abou-Rejeily, Robert Abourached, Omar Ad-dada, Michel Akl, Richard Alouche, Jean Baz, Munir Chamoun, René Chamussy, Waddah Charara, Abdullah Dagher, Farid Jabre, Antoine Fakhoury, Joseph Maila, Antoine Mourani, Antoine Messarra, Albert Nader, Pierre Nasrallah, Moussa Prince, Najib Sadaka, Elie Safa, Subhi al-Saleh, Bahij Tabbarah, Mohsen Slim, Paul Tannous, Joseph Zaarour, Afif Zienaty.
11. No listing can be exhaustive but the following is sufficient to delineate the magnitude of this group: Abbas, Afifi, Alami, Ali, Asfur, Attallah, Awad, Azzam, Baramki, Bulus, Butrus, Dabbagh, Dajani, Durr, Fakhri, Fanus, Farah, Fulayhan, Halasa, Hanania, Hanna, Hijab, Husayni, Inglessis, Juzi, Katul, Ka'war, Khalidi, Khamis, Kurban, Malak, Muwafi, Najm, Nasr, Rizk, Salti, Sayegh, Shibre, Siksik, Suwaydan, Tarazi, Tuqan, Umar, Yaqub, Yashruti, Zahlan, Zayid, Ziadeh, Zuwayyah.
12. For further elaboration, the interested reader may consult the following: Hui-zinga (1949), Illich (1980) and Peattie (1998).

13. I borrow the expression from Miriam Cooke (1988: 15) who, in exploring the literary output and background of a nucleus of women writers in Lebanon during the war, titles her first chapter as "Dance Macabre." So does, incidentally, Theodor Hanf (1993) in cataloguing the various stages and rounds of fighting.

### *7. From Playground to Battleground: Preludes to Civil Strife*

1. In addition to Gebran, Naimy, and Rihani the following are part of that illustrious core: Maroun Abboud, Amin Nakhlé, Elia Abou-Madi, Elias Abou-Chabaki, Fawzi Malouf, Said Akl, Charles Malik, Fuad Bustani, among others. For an elaboration of the contributions of this circle — many of whom were influenced by Gibran and the so-called "Mahjar" poets — who broke away from the neoclassic traditions of Arab poetry and become part of a loose coalition of "Lebanese Romantic Literature", see al Eid 1979.
2. Most prominent among this group, at least if measured by the circulation and public recognition of their output, are the following: Ilyas Abou Chabaka, al-Akhtal al-Saghir, Omar Fakhoury, Ilya Abou Madi, Khalil Takieyddin, Amin Nakhlé
3. The circle grew appreciably in size. The following are its critical core: Yusuf al-Khal, Adonis (Ali Ahmad Said), Onsi al-Hajj, Fuad Rifka, Shawki Abu Shakra, Khalil Hawi, Talal Haydar, Issam Mahfouz, Ibrahim Jabra, Etel Adnan, Nadia Tueni.
4. Reference to "Youthful" cabinet.
5. Literature on the implications of the Arab-Israeli conflict and its destabilizing impact and accounts of the direct involvement of Israel in the wars in Lebanon are extensive. The following are instructive for the kind of arguments advanced here: Bulloch 1977, 1983; Evron 1987; Gammer 1984; Gorla 1985; Haley and Snider 1979; Harkabi 1977; Herzog 1975; Hirst 1977; Khalidi 1978; Picard 1995; Rabinovich 1984; Schiff 1974; Schiff and Ya'ari 1984; Terrill 1987; Yaniv 1987.
6. No need to provide another chronicle of the pattern and escalation of such belligerent encounters. Any of the following can be consulted: Cobban 1985: 101–121; *Fiches du Monde Arabe* (Beirut and Laranka); Gorla 1985: 88–172; Petran 1987; Salibi 1976; Winslow 1996: 131–161.
7. Full texts of the Cairo Accord and Melkart Protocols can be consulted in Chamoun 1963: 175–84.
8. Bashir Gemayyel, the younger son of the Kata'ib leader, was barely twenty years of age at the time. Like other cohorts of his, he was apolitical, rather carefree and sport-loving young student. The episode was a critical turning point in his political re-socialization.

### *10. Prospects for Civility*

1. A critical core of established architects and urbanists, particularly those who had taken part in prewar construction (Assem Salam, Henri Eddeh, Pierre el-Khoury, Jad Tabet), have been very active in launching campaigns to disclose the foibles and shortcomings of Solidere and associated projects and schemes. These critical mentors have been recently joined by a growing number of fairly young, mostly Western-trained architects and urbanists. On their own or through APSAD (Association for the Protection Sites and Ancient Dwellings) and the revived Order of Engineers and Architects, they too have added their dissenting voices and proposed more viable alternatives. Hashim Sarkis, Habib Debs, Joe Nasr, Maha Yahya, Joumana Ghandour Atallah, Oussama Kabbani come to mind.
2. For further consideration of the local as “sites of resistance” to such threats of disappearance see, Dirlik (1996).
3. An edited volume by Nan Ellin (1997) contains meaningful theoretical and empirical evidence and instructive case studies substantiating the interplay between architecture, urban design, and fear.
4. For further elaboration see D. Genberg, “The Mutagenic Maquette of Beirut: A real-estate company’s claim to a city”, unpublished paper, CBR, American University of Beirut 1997.
5. Incidentally, Elisar derives its name from an ancient legend of a Phoenician queen who escaped Tyre to establish the city of Carthage. Prime Minister Hariri, a Sunni from Saida, suggested the name to commemorate this prehistoric myth. Nabih Berri, leaders of Hizbullah, and other Shi’ite notables were of course delighted to adopt the name to reassert, thereby, Shi’ite control over the southern suburb.