NOTES

PREFACE

Page xiii. **Foreign interpretations of Tibet**: The leading works on Western representations of Tibet are Peter Bishop's book, *The Myth of Shangri-La: Tibet, Travel Writing, and the Western Creation of Sacred Landscape* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989), and Donald C. Lopez's study, *Prisoners of Shangri-La: Tibetan Buddhism and the West* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998). A collection of scholarly essays on the same theme can be found in Thierry Dodin and Heinz Räther, eds., *Imagining Tibet: Perceptions, Projections, and Fantasies* (Boston: Wisdom, 2001). See also Peter Bishop's essay, "Reading the Potala," in Toni Huber, ed., *Sacred Spaces and Powerful Places in Tibetan Culture* (Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1999). Martin Brauen has produced a valuable study of material representations of Tibet in his book *Dreamworld Tibet: Western Illusions* (New York and Tokyo: Weatherhill, 2004).

Page xiv. **Madame Blavatsky**: Helena Petrovna Blavatsky (1831–1891) explained the esoteric system that she called Theosophy in a number of books, including *Isis Unveiled: A Master Key to the Mysteries of Ancient and Modern Science and Theology* (New York: J. W. Bouton, 1877, 2 vols.) and *The Secret Doctrine: The Synthesis of Science, Religion, and Philosophy* (London: The Theosophical Publishing Company, 1888, 2 vols.). She claimed that her ideas were the result of mystical contact with an unidentified "master" in Tibet. For a discussion of her uses of the Tibet motif, see Poul Pedersen, "Tibet, Theosophy, and the Psychologization of Buddhism," in Thierry Dodin and Heinz Räther, eds., *Imagining Tibet*, 151–66.

Page xxi. **The British Invasion**: A detailed account of the expedition led by Colonel Francis Younghusband in 1903–4 is given in Charles Allen, *Duel in the Snows: The True Story of the Younghusband Mission to Lhasa* (London: John Murray, 2004). See also Peter Fleming, *Bayonets to Lhasa: The First Full Account of the British Invasion of Tibet in 1904* (London: R. Hart-Davis and New York: Harper, 1961) and Parshotam Mehra, *The Younghusband Mission: An Interpretation* (New York: Asia Publishing House, 1968). Younghusband's career is described in Patrick French's biography, *Younghusband: The Last Great Imperial Adventurer* (London: HarperCollins, 1994). The colonel's own account was published as *India and Tibet: a history of the relations which have subsisted between the two countries from the time of Warren Hastings to 1910; with a particular account of the Mission to Lhasa of 1904* (London: John Murray, 1910).

Page xxiii. **Luciano Petech:** Probably the most influential Western historian of Tibet, used the term "protectorate" to describe Tibet's status from the eighteenth century, in the title of his definitive study, *China and Tibet in the Early XVIIIth Century—History of the Establishment of the Chinese Protectorate in Tibet* (*Monographies du T'oung Pao*, Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1972).

Page xxvi. **Monasteries closed before the Cultural Revolution**: The number of monasteries closed down in central and western Tibet in the early 1960s is known from "The 70,000 Character Petition," written by the tenth Panchen Lama in China in 1962. The text remains secret within China but was published in translation in Robert Barnett, ed., *A Poisoned Arrow: The Secret Petition of the Tenth Panchen Lama* (London: Tibet Information Network, 1998). The Panchen Lama wrote that "before democratic reform [1959], there were more than 2,500 large, medium and small monasteries in Tibet. After democratic reform, only 70 or so monasteries were kept in existence by the government. This was a reduction of more than 97%" (52). The term "Tibet" would not have included the eastern Tibetan areas of Amdo or eastern Kham. At the time, the Panchen Lama was nominally in the position equivalent to Governor of Tibet, had just completed a lengthy inspection tour of conditions in many Tibetan areas, and had access to official statistics. The petition, which was submitted confidentially to the Chinese premier, Zhou Enlai, and then passed to Mao Zedong, also referred to thousands of arbitrary arrests and killings, and accused local officials of allowing famine to spread in many areas.

Page xxvii. **Ideas of democracy, freedom, and Tibetan nationhood**: The political conditions and concepts behind the 1987 demonstrations are discussed in detail in Ronald Schwartz, *The Circle of Protest: Political Ritual in the Tibetan Uprising, 1987–1992* (London: Christopher Hurst and New York: Columbia University Press, 1994). The study is based on research among Tibetans in Lhasa at the time. The only published photograph of the first protest in the series of demonstrations that began on September 27, 1987 was taken by Steve Lehman and is reproduced in *The Tibetans: Struggle to Survive* (New York: Umbrage Editions, 1998).

Page xxviii. **The concessions offered in the early 1980s**: A list of the concessional policies carried out by the Chinese authorities during the early 1980s is given in "Reflections on the Current State of Theoretical Policy in Tibet" (*Xizang Ribao* [the Chinese-language edition of the official party paper, *Tibet Daily*], August 7, 1989). The article, a polemical attack on those concessions was signed by "The Tibet Youth Association for Theory." "From June 1979 to November 1985," it argues, "though there were a great many speeches aimed at eliminating 'leftism,' among those hundreds of editorials and reviews there were only eight articles that stuck to the 'Four Cardinal Principles,' all of which were published during the campaign for 'the Elimination of Bourgeois Liberalization.' Over this long period, theoretical and ideological emphasis has been on a discussion of 'Re-understanding of Tibet' and 'Proceeding in All Cases from the Reality of Tibet.' Nationality theory and religion became the most popular subjects. Though many sociopolitical activities were in the name of Marxism and Maoism, in practice the Marxist and Maoist principles were lost." The Four Cardinal Principles, as promoted by Deng Xiaoping, were the supremacy of "the socialist road"; the supremacy of the Marxist-Leninist-Maoist system; the leadership of the Communist Party; and the democratic dictatorship of the proletariat. The last was later changed to "the democratic dictatorship of the people." I am grateful to the late Graham Clarke and to Jinchai Clarke for having drawn my attention to this important article. For critical accounts of policies in the Tibet Autonomous Region during the early 1980s, see Tsering Shakya, *The Dragon in the Land of Snows: A History of Modern Tibet Since 1947* (London: Pimlico and New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), 394–409; Tseten Wangchuk Sharlho, "China's Reforms in Tibet: Issues and Dilemmas," *Journal of Contemporary China* 1, no. 1 (Fall 1993): 34–60; and Warren Smith, *Tibetan Nation: A History of Tibetan Nationalism and Sino-Tibetan Relations* (Boulder: Westview, 1996), 563–96.

PREAMBLE

Page 1. **The Grove of Wild Roses**: This phrase is a translation of the name of Sera, a famous monastery founded in 1419 about two miles north of the center of Lhasa; the name is often mistranslated as "the place of hail." "The heap of rice" is the literal meaning of Drepung, the monastery five miles west of the capital, founded in 1416. The name is sometimes said to have arisen because of the appearance from afar of the white buildings on the slopes of Mount Gamphel Utse, but is more likely a reference to Dhanyakataka, the "string of grain," an early Buddhist monastery that flourished in Orissa in eastern India (see Sarat Chandra Das, *Tibetan-English Dictionary* [Calcutta: Bengal Secretariat Book Depot, 1902], 929); the site is now within Andhra Pradesh. "The place of bliss" is a loose translation of Ganden (literally, "having joy"), the Tibetan term for the Mahayana Buddhist paradise known in Sanskrit as Tushita. The name

was given to the monastery that was founded in 1409 some 35 miles northeast of the city. These are the monasteries known in Tibetan as the *densasum*, or "the three seats." They were founded by the religious reformer Tsongkhapa (1357–1419) or his followers and led to the establishment of the Gelugpa school of Tibetan Buddhism—known in Chinese and some other sources as the "Yellow Hat" school—which became the dominant political force in Tibet after 1642 under its principal teachers, the Dalai Lamas. Before 1959 there are said to have been 5,000 monks in Sera, 10,000 in Drepung, and 7,000 in Ganden. The monasteries were unofficially reported in 2000 to have approximately 300, 700, and 200 monks respectively.

Page 1. **A city of some 200,000 people**: In the census carried out by the Chinese authorities in 1990 the population of the urban area of Lhasa was given as 163,000, and 29.5 percent of the inhabitants were identified as not Tibetans. This figure did not include temporary migrants, sometimes estimated in official documents at between 70,000 and 150,000 a year, or the military. Chinese official statistics concerning Lhasa are confusing because they usually relate to the larger area called in Chinese *Lasa shi,* literally the city or municipality of Lhasa. This term refers to a vast territory, equivalent in the Chinese administrative system to a *diqu* or prefecture, that includes hundreds of square miles of pasture and rural land, many towns, and seven other counties besides the actual city of Lhasa. The census in 2000 reported 141,500 Tibetans and some 75,000 Chinese, Hui (Chinese Muslims), and others as living in "city areas" of the TAR; the phrase probably refers to the built-up area at the center of the Lhasa conurbation, but could also include Shigatse, the second most important urban area in Tibet, which is sometimes also defined by the Chinese authorities as a city. The figures, probably underestimates, suggest that the official population for Lhasa and Shigatse was about 216,500. The latter town is sometimes estimated at having a population of 20,000 to 30,000. See "Overview of the Tibetan Population in the PRC from the 2000 Census," Tibet Information Network, September 30, 2003.

1. THE UNITARY VIEW

Page 5. **Dorje Yuthok's autobiography**: The autobiography of Dorje Yuthok, *House of the Turquoise Roof* (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion, 1990), is one of several accounts of life in Lhasa produced in English in the late twentieth century by exiled Tibetan aristocrats or their biographers. Others include Rinchen Dolma Taring, *Daughter of Tibet* (London: John Murray, 1970); Jamyang Sakya and Julie Emery, *Princess in the Land of Snows: The Life of Jamyang Sakya in Tibet* (Boston: Shambhala, 1990); Jetsun Pema with Gilles Van Grasdorff, *Tibet: My Story: An Autobiography by the Sister of the Dalai Lama* (Shaftesbury, Dorset: Element, 1997); D. N. Tsarong, *In the Service of His Country: The Biography of Dasang Damdul Tsarong, Commander General of Tibet* (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion,

2000); and Namgyal Lhamo Takla, *Born in Lhasa* (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion, 2001). All of these except for the Tsarong volume are by women from noble families. The publication of English-language autobiographies by Tibetans in exile has been studied in Laurie Hovell McMillin, *English in Tibet, Tibet in English: Self-Presentation in Tibet and the Diaspora* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001). A number of biographies and autobiographies of important lamas were also produced, such as those of the Dalai Lama, Chogyam Trungpa, and Khyongla Rato Rinpoche.

Page 6. **Rinchen Lhamo**: Rinchen Lhamo's book about the Tibetan people, which includes her comments on the attitudes of Londoners toward them, is the earliest English-language account by a Tibetan. It was published as *We Tibetans: An Intimate Picture, by a Woman of Tibet of an Interesting and Distinctive People* (London: Seeley Service and Co., 1926; reprint, New York: Potala Publications, 1995), 95–96. Rinchen Lhamo came from a wealthy family in Kham (eastern Tibet) and married Louis Macgrath King, an English diplomat who had been stationed in Dartsend (Tachienlu), and returned with him to London. The couple communicated in Chinese. She continues the remark cited here as follows: "Just before I came to Europe a high official connected with Tibetan politics said in my presence that the Tibetans were a simple people. This remark was so wide of the fact that I could not refrain from laughing. He was merely giving utterance to a conventional statement about us put into vogue by the travellers." The Dharamsala-based historian Tashi Tsering cites this quotation in his discussion of earlier Tibetan writings about Tibet and Tibetans, *How the Tibetans Have Regarded Themselves Through the Ages* (Dharamsala: Amnye Machen Institute, 1996).

Page 7. **Exiles and Westerners who were their scribes**: Many accounts of the lives of exiled Tibetans produced in English have relied on ghostwriters not very familiar with Tibetan. However, there are some notable exceptions, such as Tsewang Pemba's autobiography, *Young Days in Tibet* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1957) and Palden Gyatso's collaborative autobiography with Tsering Shakya, *Fire Under the Snow: The Testimony of a Tibetan Prisoner* (London: Harvill Press, 1998), published in the United States under the title *The Autobiography of a Tibetan Monk* (New York: Grove Press, 1997). An earlier, lesser-known example is Tashi Khedrup (compiled by Hugh Richardson), *Adventures of a Tibetan Fighting Monk* (Bangkok: Tamarind, 1986); Richardson was fluent in Tibetan. Two important collaborative autobiographies of Tibetans who remained within Tibet (Tashi Tsering, *The Struggle for Modern Tibet* and Baba Phuntsog Wanggyal, *A Tibetan Revolutionary*) have been produced by Melvyn Goldstein, also a fluent speaker.

Page 7. **Modern Chinese accounts of their non-Chinese nationalities**: Chinese views of their "minority nationalities" have been discussed by Western anthropologists in some detail since the late 1980s. See Chiao Chien and Nicholas Tapp, eds., *Ethnicity and Ethnic Groups in China* (Hong Kong: Chinese University of

Hong Kong, 1989); Dru Gladney, "Representing Nationality in China: Refiguring Majority/Minority Identities," *Journal of Asian Studies* 53, no. 1 (1994): 92–123; Stevan Harrell, "Civilizing Projects and the Reaction to Them," in Stevan Harrell, ed., *Cultural Encounters on China's Ethnic Frontiers* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1995), 3–36; Melissa Brown, ed., *Negotiating Ethnicities in China and Taiwan* (Berkeley: East Asian Institute, University of California, 1995); Louisa Schein, "Performing Modernity," *Cultural Anthropology* 14, no. 3 (1997): 361–95; and Susan Blum, *Portraits of "Primitives"* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield, 2001).

Page 7. **Publishing the seen impressions of foreign visitors**: For some time after the establishment of the PRC, Chinese officials based their work with foreigners on a principle that they termed "seeing is believing." Until the 1980s, however, this was in practice limited to those already considered friendly to official views. Tsan-Kuo Chang notes how supporters of China in the 1960s used this idea to discredit American journalists who were then not allowed to enter China, and shows how the writer and filmmaker Felix Greene, who made three trips to China before 1964, was able to question "the accuracy of some of the reports about Communist China conveyed to the American people by the press. He had been there in China and thus knew better. For most American journalists who had never visited China, Greene's charges were difficult to refute" ("China from Here and There: More Than Two Decades of Closed Borders and Narrowed Vision," *Media Studies Journal* [Winter 1999]). Chinese officials modified this approach in the late 1990s, when it was decided to try to convey information concerning Tibet to the West by developing closer relations with Western universities and with scholars of Tibetan studies, rather than by relying on visits by Western politicians or friendly journalists. The policy change is documented in International Campaign for Tibet, *China's Public Relations Strategy on Tibet: Classified Documents from the Beijing Propaganda Conference* (Washington: International Campaign for Tibet, November 15, 1993), which includes a translation of "Speech by Comrade Tenzin" (TAR Conference on External Propaganda Work Document No. 8, Regional Conference on External Propaganda Work, Beijing, March 11, 1993).

The emphasis on visual impressions persists in some journalistic and literary accounts, as, for example, in this article from *China Daily*, China's main English-language newspaper: "The Tibetan people always take great pride in their dress and the accessories they wear. This is evident in the heavy and well-preserved dresses passed down across generations and still shining on happy Tibetans.... Women on the prairie of northern Tibet look the most beautiful in summer when the flowers are in full bloom" ("Tibetan Finery Brightens an Austere Land," *China Daily*, May 24, 2004).

Page 70. **A Mexican senator**: The quotation from the Mexican visitor to Tibet is taken from "Great Changes Seen in Tibet—Moreno," *China Daily*, August 19, 1997.

Page 8. **Happy smiles on their faces**: Statements by Chinese officials about the happiness of Tibetans after 1980 can be found in governmental policy statements as well as in the official press. The phrase "the people of Tibet highly value their happy life today" was used frequently in official texts in the 1990s; see, for example, "Tibet University Campaign to Fight Separatism, Get Rid of Dalai Lama's Influence" (Tibet People's Broadcasting Station, April 14, 1997; published in translation in *BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*, April 15, 1997). Chen Kuiyuan, the Party Secretary of Tibet from 1992 to 2000, in a famous speech about art and the media in 1997, described a good radio program as one that "accords with the happy mood and mental attitude of the Tibetan people" ("Tibet Party Secretary Criticizes 'Erroneous Views' of Literature, Art," *Xizang Ribao (Tibet Daily)*, July 16, 1997, 1, 4, published in translation and retitled by the *BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*, August 5, 1997). Li Kai and Zhao Xinbing, in their booklet *Spectacles on the Snowy Plateau* (Beijing: China Intercontinental Press, 1995), refer to "the rich and happy life [that] is fully reflected in every aspect of the daily activities of the Tibetan people" (21).

Page 11. **Stories of monkish misbehavior**: Several episodes involving significant conflict or unrest in early twentieth-century Tibetan politics are described by Melvyn Goldstein in *A History of Modern Tibet: The Demise of the Lamaist State* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989). The protest by the monks of Loseling arose ostensibly over a dispute concerning land leases but really was a result of government disapproval of the monks' earlier support of the Chinese during the 1910–12 occupation of Lhasa. The episode is described in *History of Modern Tibet*, 104–109, and in Goldstein's earlier article, "Religious Conflict in the Traditional Tibetan State," in Lawrence Epstein and Richard F. Sherburne, eds., *Reflections on Tibetan Culture: Essays in Memory of Turrell V. Wylie* (Lewiston, ME: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1990), 231–47. The Dalai Lama's references to small incidents of theft and irritation among his retinue during his early years can be found in his second autobiography, *Freedom in Exile* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1990; San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991, pp. 14–15, 48–49). An account of a dispute between the leading Tibetan officials and younger reformers is given in Alex McKay, "Tibet 1924: A Very British Coup Attempt?," *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, Series 3, 7, 3 (November 1997).

Page 11. **Struggles to get control of the Sakya dynasty**: The dispute between the two lines of the Sakya family is described by Jamyang Sakya in her autobiography, *Princess in the Land of Snows*. Melvyn Goldstein adds a note about the dispute in his article "The Balance Between Centralization and Decentralization in the Traditional Tibetan Political System: An Essay on the Nature of Tibetan Political Macro-Structure," *Central Asiatic Journal* XV (1971): 170–82. Goldstein suggests that the losers in this dispute were among the main informants used by C. W. Cassinelli and Robert B. Ekvall in their study of Sakya politics, *A Tibetan Principality: The Political System of Sa sKya* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1969), and that the findings of that study may have been skewed.

Page 11. **Outsiders in the manufacture of Tibetan myths**: I am grateful to Losang Rabgey for her insights on this question.

Page 12. **Six government officials executed**: The fighting with the Chinese began in late 1911 and continued for a year. In January 1912, *Tsipön* (Finance Minister) Trimon and Champa Tendar were appointed by the thirteenth Dalai Lama—then living in exile in India—as his representatives in the war effort. Champa Tendar ordered the execution of Tsarong, a *kalön* or cabinet minister, as well as of his son and of the cabinet secretary, Tsashagpa, for having had close relations with the Chinese, according to the account given by the former finance minister in W. D. Shakabpa, *Tibet: A Political History* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967; reprint, New York: Potala, 1984), 241. Three other senior officials were executed for having been on friendly terms with the monks of Tengyeling—Phunrabpa, the chancellor; Mondrong, a member of the national assembly; and Lobsang Dorje, a monk official. Goldstein describes these "executions" as "murders [by] pro-Dalai Lama forces" (*History of Modern Tibet* 64). An account by the former *kalön* Wangchen Gelek Surkhang suggests that these killings involved little or no official procedure, and notes that the executions of Tsarong's son, Phunrabpa, and Tsashagpa were carried out by Sera monks. Surkhang's account is given in his article "Tibet in the Early 20th Century" (*Tibetan Studies Internet Newsletter* 1, no. 2 [January 12, 1999]: part IV, also available at www.cwru.edu/affil/tibet/booksAndPapers/early20thtibet.htm).

Page 12. **The British Public School of Rugby**: The history of the four schoolboys sent with Lungshar to England in 1913 is discussed by Tsering Shakya in his article, "The Making of the Great Game Players: Tibetan Students in England 1912–1916," *Tibetan Review* XXI, no. 1. (1986): 12–17, and in Clare Harris and Tsering Shakya, eds., *Seeing Lhasa: British Depictions of the Tibetan Capital 1936–1947* (London: Serindia, 2003), 99ff. Changnöpa Ringang returned in 1924 with a degree in electrical engineering, the first graduate in Tibet; Kyibuk Wangdu Norbu had greater difficulty in adapting to English conditions and returned seven years earlier. See also Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 157 (fig. 19) and 159*n*24.

Page 12. **Lungshar returned...with notions of modernity**: An account in Tibetan of the Lungshar episode is given by Lungshar's son, Lhalu Tsewang Dorje, in "*Nga'i pha lung shar rdo rje tshe rgyal dran gso byas pa*" (Recollections of my father, Lungshar Dorje Tsegyal) in Bod rang skyong ljongs srid gros lo rgyus rig gnas dpyad gzhi'i rgyu cha zhib 'jug u yon lhan khang, *Bod kyi lo rgyus rig gnas dpyad gzhi'i rgyu cha bdams bsgrigs* (*Materials on the History and Culture of Tibet* [Beijing: Nationalities Publishing House, 1983], 2:93–109). The most extensive description of the Lungshar affair in English is given in Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 186–212, 819. In Chinese, a fictionalized account has been written by Yangdron (Tibetan: Dbyangs sgrol, Chinese: Yangzhen) in *Wu xingbie de shen* (*God Without Gender* or, in Tibetan, '*phrul kun 'dzoms kyi lha*). Her novel was turned into a twenty-episode television drama series, *Lasa Wangshi* (Tibetan: *lha*

sa'i sngon byung gtam rgyud) or *The Tale of Lhasa's Past*, with script by Huang Zhilung, Zhen Lu, and Wang Zhangbo (CCTV/Tibet TV, 2001).

Lungshar seems never to have complained about what was done to him, according to the account given in Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 211–12. Shakabpa, the former finance minister writing in exile in the 1960s, was less sympathetic, describing Lungshar and his group as "political bandits" who were meddling in "highly confidential matters." He claims that their plans had included assassinating the regent. Kabshöpa, the official who joined Lungshar's group and then denounced them, is seen in some accounts as treacherous, but is described by Shakabpa as a "sagacious man" for revealing the conspiracy (*Tibet: A Political History* 275).

Page 12. **The tacit approval of the British**: There is no explicit evidence that the British encouraged the Tibetan government in the many allegations against Lungshar, but Hugh Richardson, a member of the British mission in Lhasa for most of the 1940s and later of the Indian mission, attributed to Lungshar the policy of "turning away from innovations and the British connection," referring to him as "a flamboyant daemonic figure" who exhibited "dazzling impetuosity" and had "simply a lust for power." In his later writings Richardson publicly endorsed the accusations of Bolshevism against Lungshar, and said he had been prepared to use "bribery, murder and sorcery" (*Tibet and Its History,* 2nd ed. [Boulder: Shambhala, 1984], 138, 141). The rumor concerning the crushing of Retring's testicles is reported in Richardson, *High Peaks*, 719.

Page 13. **The civil war in 1947**: The events that culminated with the death of the regent, Retring Rinpoche, are described in Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 464–521; in Shakabpa, *Tibet: A Political History*, 292–94; and in Richardson, *Tibet and Its History*.

Page 14. **The Japanese spy-explorer Hisao Kimura**: Kimura's recollections of his life in Tibet in the 1940s were given to Scott Berry some forty years later, after Kimura had become a professor of Tibetan studies in Japan. The account—one of the most insightful foreign descriptions of life in 1940s Lhasa—is published as Hisao Kimura and Scott Berry, *A Japanese Agent in Tibet: My Ten Years of Travel in Tibet* (London: Serindia, 1990).

Page 14. **The fourteenth Dalai Lama describes having heard the sound of gunfire**: The Dalai Lama refers to the conflict with the monks of Sera Je in *Freedom in Exile*, pp. 32–33. The number of Sera monks killed in this incident is given as 200 in Richardson, *Tibet and Its History,* 169ff, and as 300 in Richardson, *High Peaks*, 718.

Page 15. **The paramount place granted to religion in the Tibetan political system**: The Tibetan system of government rested on a specific theory of integrating politics with religion, known in Tibetan as *chos srid zung 'brel* or "religion and politics combined." A history of Tibet examining this principle was written by Dung-dkar blo-bzang 'phrin-las (Dungkar Lobsang Thrinley) under the title *Bod kyi chos srid zung 'brel skor bshad pa* (Beijing: Nationalities Publish-

ing House, 1981; published in English as *The Merging of Religious and Secular Rule in Tibet* [Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1991]). This governmental idea was articulated from the time when the fifth Dalai Lama was installed by the Mongol leader Gushri Khan as the political ruler of Tibet in 1642. It lasted until sometime after the Chinese arrived in 1950. In a communiqué addressed to Chiang Kai-shek in 1946 and copied to the British mission in Lhasa, the Tibetan National Assembly described their pride in this political arrangement: "There are many great nations on this earth who have achieved unprecedented wealth and might, but there is only one nation which is dedicated to the well-being of humanity in the world, and that is the religious land of Tibet which cherishes a joint spiritual and temporal system.... We shall continue to preserve and protect our joint spiritual and temporal system and our territories as we have done hitherto" (cited in Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 542).

Page 15. **Tibet and the League of Nations:** The Tibetan decision to reject Gilbert Murray's suggestion in the 1920s that they apply to join the League of Nations is documented in Tsering Shakya, "Tibet and the League of Nations," *The Tibet Journal* X, no. 3 (1985): 48–56. The Tibetan government sent an official to London to assess the proposal in 1927 but finally decided to turn it down, anticipating that the international community would pressure it to end the politico-religious system.

Page 15. "**Better an enemy who is close**": The version of this proverb that Kabshöpa used in recommending nearby enemies over faraway friends was *thag ring gnyen las mdron pa'i dgra dga'*. A similar concept is found in the variant form given by Lhamo Pemba in his collection of Tibetan sayings: *gsar 'grogs che ba'i gnyen las / phyi thag ring ba'i dgra bo dga'*—"The steady animosity of an old enemy is better than the affection of a new friend." See Lhamo Pemba, *Tibetan Proverbs* (Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1996), 199.

Page 17. **Technology and its incursions**: The extension of telecommunications to Tibet and Chapman's comments on this are discussed by Bishop in *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 185–93. The three-hour gap between the publication of news in London and its arrival with the British expedition is noted in Francis Younghusband, *India and Tibet*, 197–200. The extension of the telegraph line to Lhasa is described in W. King, "The Telegraph to Lhasa," *The Geographical Journal* 63 (1924): 527–31. The Dalai Lama's telephone and his two cars are described in F. Spencer Chapman, *Lhasa: The Holy City* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1938), 11 and 185–86.

Page 18. **The radical nationalist Gendun Chöphel**: The most important study of Gendun Chöphel is Heather Stoddard's book, *Le Mendiant de l'Amdo* (Paris: Société d'Ethnographie, Université de Paris X, 1985). Besides Stoddard's work, a number of studies have been written on this famous literary and religious figure among Tibetan progressives. They include K. Dhondup, "Gedun Chophel: The Man Behind the Legend," *Tibetan Review* 12, no. 10 (1978): 10–18, and Donald Lopez, "Madhyamika Meets Modernity: The Life and Works of Gedun Chopel,"

Tricycle (Spring 1995):42–51. Irmgard Mengele has published a short biography under the title *dGe-'dun-chos-'phel. A Biography of the Twentieth-Century Tibetan Scholar* (Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1999), and Toni Huber has published a translation of one work together with an introduction to Gendun Chöphel's life in *The Guide to India: A Tibetan Account by Amdo Gendun Chöphel* (Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 2000).

There are several Tibetan biographies of Gendun Chöphel, including Dorje Gyal (rdo rje rgyal), *'Dzam gling rig pa'i dpa' bo rdo brag dge 'dun chos 'phel gyi byung ba brjod pa bden gtam rna ba'i bcud len* (*A Hero of World Knowledge—The Essence of the Heard Account of Dodrag Gendun Chöphel's True Life and Sayings* [Lanzhou: Gansu Nationalities' Publishing House, 1997]). A Chinese biography of Gendun Chöphel has been written by Du Yongbin, *Xizang de ren wen zhu yi xian qu geng dun qun pei da shi ping zhuan* (*A Critical Biography of Master Gedun Chophel, Pioneer of Humanism* [Beijing: China Tibetology Publishing House, 1999]).

Page 18. **The former dancer Tashi Tsering**: The views and experiences of Tashi Tsering are described by Melvyn Goldstein, Tashi Tsering, and William Siebenschuh in their joint publication, *The Struggle for Modern Tibet: The Autobiography of Tashi Tsering* (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1997).

Page 18. **A small, dissident group of Tibetans with progressive ideas**: Extensive accounts of Tibetan progressives and radicals besides Gendun Chöphel who were active in Tibet or northern India during the early twentieth century can be found in Heather Stoddard's *Le Mendiant*. Shorter descriptions of some of these figures are given in T. N. Takla's article, "Notes on Some Early Tibetan Communists," *Tibetan Review* II, no. 17 (1969): 7–10, and in Heather Stoddard's paper, "Tibet: Transition from Buddhism to Communism," *Government and Opposition* 21, no. 1 (Winter 1986): 75–95.

Prominent among these Tibetans was Rabga Pangdatsang (also spelled Pomdatsang), whose history has been studied by Carole McGranahan in *Arrested Histories: Between Empire and Exile in Twentieth-Century Tibet* (Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan, 2001), and in "*Sa sPang mda' gNam sPang mda'*: Murder, History, and Social Politics in 1920s Lhasa," in Lawrence Epstein, ed., *Khams pa Histories: Visions of People, Place and Authority* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 2002), 103–26. Her studies have expanded the work done by Heather Stoddard on Rabga Pangdatshang in *Le Mendiant*. The founding of the Tibet Progressive Party is also described in Goldstein, *History of Modern Tibet*, 450–61. For a study of Uighur progressives in this period, and the complexities of their relationships with the Chinese state, see Linda Benson, "Uygur Politicians of the 1940s: Mehmet Emin Bugra, Isa Yusuf Alptekin, and Mesut Sabri," *Central Asian Survey* 10, no. 4 (1991): 87–114.

A Chinese writer's view of three Tibetan progressives is given by Ma Lihua in *Old Lhasa: A Sacred City at Dusk* (Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 2003), 195–224. Ma deals with the tenth Demo, Kunphel-la, and Gendun Chöphel;

only the last two are included in most Western accounts of Tibetan progressives in this period. Her account of them is based on the Chinese translation of Goldstein's *History of Modern Tibet* (translated by Du Yongbin as *Lama Wangguo de Fumie* [Beijing: Current Affairs Publishing House, 1994]). Ma criticizes British interference in these Tibetans' efforts to reform aspects of Tibetan culture or society.

Ma also presents one of China's *amban*s to Tibet, Zhang Yintang, as an early reformer. He had served in Lhasa as the *Amban* or Imperial Commissoner for seven months in 1904–5, and was the first ethnically Chinese *amban*, all his predecessors having been Mongolian or Manchurian. He had worked as a diplomat for China in the United States, and is said by Ma to have given lectures at the Jokhang on evolution and on British colonialism. He published a pamphlet in Lhasa called *Elementary Ethics* and another called *Change Your Habits and Ways*. According to Ma, he "failed to change the backward social habits of the Tibetans," but "his spirit will be remembered forever by both the Tibetan and Han peoples" (Ma, *Old Lhasa*, 133–43), though she does not offer evidence to support the latter claim.

A similar but more nuanced case for Zhang had been presented twenty years earlier in Wang Furen and Suo Wenqing, *Highlights of Tibetan History* (Beijing: New World Press, 1984). Wang and Suo are more critical than Ma of Zhang's efforts to impose new standards on Tibetans: they describe his pamphlets and proposals as "written from the standpoint of Han chauvinism" and say that he "dismissed Tibet's language, customs and time-honoured moral standards, while imposing those that prevailed in the Han areas" (142).

Page 18. ***Baba* Phuntsog Wanggyal**: Phuntsog Wanggyal came from Bathang in eastern Tibet, now part of Sichuan; the epithet *Baba* refers to his birthplace. He was the only early Tibetan progressive to hold a significant position after 1950: he was appointed to the Tibet Work Committee, the shadow organization set up by the Communist Party to run Tibet in the 1950s, and was the only Tibetan member for most of its life. He was purged after eight years and spent eighteen years in prison, technically for having had a copy of Lenin's treatise on nationality policy among his possessions. The current Dalai Lama describes him with some warmth in *Freedom in Exile*, but the first detailed account of his life came only with the emergence in 1999 of a handwritten manuscript from Beijing that was attributed to one Zla ba'i shes rab (Dawei Sherap, a pseudonym meaning "Knowledge of the Moon"). The manuscript, which gave an important account of Phuntsok Wanggyal's life, was entitled *Sgor ra nang pa phun tshogs dbang rgyal (phun dbang) gyi mdzad rnam mtor bsdus* (*A Brief Biography of Phuntsog Wanggyal Goranangpa*). This text later appeared as appendix II of the English-language publication of an obscure philosophical treatise on dialectics by Phuntsog Wanggyal, *Liquid Water Does Exist on the Moon* (*Zla ba'i nang gsher gzugs yod* [Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 2002]), 434–80. A similar but less detailed biography had earlier appeared in

an article by Wang Fan and Chen Shumei, "The Man Whom Time Forgot," *Renwu* (*Personalities*) 3 (1996). These articles indicated for the first time that a Tibetan Communist Party had been established by Phuntsog Wanggyal and others in eastern Tibet in 1939 or shortly after, and, more important, that the fledgling organization had had no direct connections with the Chinese Communist Party. This claim has not apparently been accepted by the CCP. A major and authoritative account of Phuntsog Wanggyal's life was published by Melvyn C. Goldstein, Dawei Sherap, and William R. Siebenschuh as *A Tibetan Revolutionary—The Political Life and Times of Bapa Phüntso Wangye* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004).

Page 19. **The Tibetan People's Unified Alliance**: This was the name of Phuntsog Wanggyal's front organization in Lhasa, but it included as its secret core group an organization called *Gangs ljong bod rigs gung khran ring lugs gsar brje tshogs chung*—"The Tibetan Snowland Communist Revolutionary Association" (see Dawei Sherap, *A Brief Biography*, and Goldstein, Dawei Sherap, and Siebenschuh, *A Tibetan Revolutionary*, 70). "The Communist Group resolved that to fight for national liberation and make democratic reforms were its immediate and principal tasks," according to Dawei Sherap's *Brief Biography*. The core group had been formed earlier at a house called the Chubagang in Lhasa, and Phuntsog Wanggyal says that it later included the young Lhasa aristocrat Tomjor Tethong, at whose house the front organization's meetings were held.

Page 19. ***Kalön* Surkhang**: Phuntsog Wanggyal's meetings with Surkhang, the brother of Dorje Yuthok, are described in Goldstein, Dawei Sherap, and Siebenschuh, *A Tibetan Revolutionary*, 76–77. Goldstein also gives the full text of Phuntsog Wanggyal's revolutionary song calling for the creation of a Tibetan state that would include all the traditional Tibetan areas.

Page 20. **The Tromsikhang**: The history of the Tromsikhang and its demolition, apart from its façade, is documented in André Alexander and Pimpim de Azevedo, *The Old City of Lhasa—Report from a Conservation Project (98–99)* (Tibet Heritage Fund at www.asianart.com/lhasa_restoration/report98/index.htm), part 8. The Lhasa Municipal Planning Office had called for most of the Tromsikhang to be demolished, except for the frontage on the Barkor, according to Alexander and de Azevedo, despite the fact that officials in the TAR Cultural Relics Bureau had recommended preservation of the building. The writers note that some elements of the building were preserved within the new structure when it was completed in 1998. "The Tromsikhang is only the second non-monastic building in the old city to be restored by the government (the first one was the old courthouse, Nangtseshar, in 1995)," they add. See also "Historic Lhasa Palace Demolition," Tibet Information Network, June 18, 1997, and "Lhasa Palace's Future in Dispute," Associated Press, June 20, 1997. The early history of the Tromsikhang and the murders of the two Ambans in 1751 are described in Luciano Petech, *China and Tibet in the Early XVIIIth Century*.

Page 21. **The Chinese Military Headquarters in Lhasa**: There were only four military bases in or near the city in the 1950s: at Drib on the south side of the river, at Danpa just below Drepung, at Beding, and the *junqu* or headquarters on the south side of the Lingkor opposite the Yamen. From the mid-1960s there was an army camp at Parikhu near Gönpasar, which also included a work camp for aristocrats and other members of the Political Consultative Conference. At least a dozen other bases were added later, most notably the half-mile-long military camp built in 1991 at Dongkar Bridge, near Toelung, on the western approach road to Lhasa (see "New Military Headquarters: Tibet Construction Boom," in *TIN News Compilation, October 1993 Reports from Tibet 1992–3*, London: Tibet Information Network, 97).

Page 21. **The Kyitöpa**: Phuntsog Wanggyal refers to the school at the Kyitöpa where he taught in Goldstein, Dawei Sherap, and Siebenschuh, *A Tibetan Revolutionary*, 114–15. An account by Chen Xizhang, "My Work as Secretary General of the KMT Tibet Office (II)" was published in English in *China's Tibet* 4 (2000), but this version did not include comments on the espionage networks in Lhasa. Kimura gives extensive details of the feuds between the Chinese intelligence services, and refers to several murders, in Kimura and Berry, *A Japanese Agent in Tibet*, 150–51.

Page 22. **The British spy network**: Claims that the British supplied the Tibetan government with details about Communist sympathizers in Lhasa in 1949 are made by Xirab Nyima in his contribution to Wang Jiawei and Nima Jianzhan's compilation, *The Historical Status of Tibet* (Beijing: China Intercontinental Press, 1997; published in Chinese as Wang Gui, Xiraonima, and Tang Jiawei, *Xizang Lishi Diwei Bian—Ping Xiageba "Xizang Zhengzhishi" he Fanpulahe "Xizang de Diwei"* (*The Historical Status of Tibet—A Response to Xiageba's [Shakapba's] "Political History of the Tibetan Region" and Fanpulahe's [Van Walt's] "The Status of Tibet"* [Beijing: Nationalities Publishing House, 1995], chapter VI, part 13).

Richardson denied that the British had any prior knowledge of the 1949 expulsion of Communist sympathizers and Chinese. The Chinese authorities later claimed that Robert Ford had been a spy for the British, especially while he was a radio operator for the Tibetan government in Chamdo in 1950. Similar accusations were made about his colleague Reginald Fox, then working in Lhasa. See Robert Ford, *Wind Between the Worlds: The Extraordinary First-Person Account of a Westerner's Life in Tibet as an Official of the Dalai Lama's Government* (New York: David McKay, 1957), later published as *Captured in Tibet* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990).

Page 23. **Jiang Xinxi**: Hisao Kimura gives a description of Phuntsog Wanggyal's uncle, the spymaster and general Jiang Xinxi. Kimura thought that Jiang's lack of loyalty to the Republican cause (which Kimura inferred from the fact that Jiang lied about his nephew's political affiliations) was a result of discrimination that he had experienced as a Tibetan, and his sense that he had therefore been denied promotion. Kimura became close to Phuntsog Wanggyal and his circle,

and even invested in Jiang's failed restaurant (Kimura and Berry, *A Japanese Agent in Tibet*, 205). He described daily meetings with Phuntsog Wanggyal at which they discussed detailed plans for a new constitution for Tibet, borrowing in part from the Japanese model, which Kimura felt had much to offer to the Tibetans (201). But neither Kimura nor any Japanese precedents are mentioned in Phuntsog Wanggyal's biographies.

Page 23. **Radical Indian intellectuals**: An important influence on Gendun Chöphel was Rahul Sankrityayana, the only figure in modern Indian studies known to have gone to Tibet before 1950 to study the Sanskrit texts preserved there. He was born Kedarnath Pandey in Azamgarh, Uttar Pradesh, in 1893 and learned thirteen languages (some followers claim that he knew thirty). He became a major scholar of Sanskrit and Buddhism, as well as a leading organizer and activist in the Communist Party of India. He is said to have brought back some 2,000 texts to India on his return from Tibet in the 1930s. He later held the position of professor of Indology at the University of Leningrad from 1937 to 1938 and from 1947 to 1948. By the time of his death in 1963 he had published some 150 books and pamphlets, mostly in Hindi, including *Meri Jeewan Yatra* (*My Journey Through Life* [Allahabad, 1961]) and Rahul Sankrityayan et al., *Buddhism: The Marxist Approach* (New Delhi: People's Publishing Ho use, 1970).

2. FOREIGN VISITORS, OSCILLATIONS, AND EXTREMES

Page 27. **The writings of Western visitors to Lhasa**: The first eyewitness account of Tibet to appear in a Western language was Antonio de Andrade's *Relatione del Novo Scoprimento del Gran Cataio, overo Regno di Tibet* (Rome: Corbelletti, 1627) and *Prosigue el descubrimento del gran Catay, o Reynos del gran Thibet, por el Pade Antonio Andrade. de la Compagñia de Iesus, Potugues...*(Segovia: Diego Flamenco, 1628). These were based on his work as a missionary in western Tibet. The first description of Lhasa by a foreign visitor came in the letters of the Jesuit missionary Desideri, who spent nearly seven years in the city in the early eighteenth century and became fluent in the local language. The letters were later published in Ippolito Desideri (edited by Filippo de Filippi), *An Account of Tibet. The Travels of Ippolito Desideri of Pistoia, S.J., 1712–1727* (London: George Routledge & Sons, Ltd., 1937) and H. Hosten, S.J. (editor and translator), *Missionary in Tibet: Letters and Other Papers of Father Ippolito Desideri, S.J. (1713–21)* (New Delhi: Cosmo Publications, 1999). The Capuchin father Francesco Orazio della Penna di Billi wrote an account of his time in Tibet following his stay in Lhasa as a missionary in the early eighteenth century, *Brief Account of the Kingdom of Tibet* (1730), reproduced in appendix III of Markham's collection of visitors' accounts to Lhasa. The collection includes Thomas Manning's account of his 1811 visit; see Clements Markham, *Narratives of the Mission of George Bogle to Tibet, and of the Journey of Thomas Manning to Lhasa* (London, 1879).

The writings of early Catholic missionaries are collected in Luciano Petech, *I Missionari Italiani nel Tibet e nel Nepal* (Rome: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente, 1951–56) and are summarized in C. Wessels, *Early Jesuit Travellers in Central Asia, 1603–1721* (The Hague, 1924; reprint, New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 1992). The history of the Capuchin mission has been presented in Fr. Fulgentius Vannini, O.F.M., *The Bell of Lhasa* (no publisher is given but the reader is referred to the Capuchin Ashram, Agra; printed at Devarsons, New Delhi, 1976).

Later an account of a much shorter visit to Lhasa was given by Abbé Huc, *Souvenirs D'Un Voyage Dans La Tartarie, Le Thibet Et La Chine Pendant Les Années 1844, 1845* (Paris, 1850). It was published in English as *Recollections of a journey through Tartary, Thibet, and China (1844–6)* (New York, 1852). A Japanese monk's description of his life in Lhasa, which he disliked intensely, was given by Ekai Kawaguchi in his memoir *Three Years in Tibet* (Benares and London: Theosophical Publishing Society, 1909).

English-language writing on Lhasa in the early twentieth century is dominated by the work of those who accompanied the Younghusband expedition. Among the principal accounts are those of Edmund Candler (correspondent for *The Daily Mail*; his name is often misspelled as Chandler), *The Unveiling of Lhasa* (London: Edward Arnold, 1905); Perceval Landon (*The Times* special correspondent), *LHASA: An account of the country and people of central Tibet and of the progress of the mission sent there by the English Government in the year 1903–1904* (London: Hurst and Blackett, 1905), published in the United States as *The Opening of Tibet: An account of Lhasa and the people of central Tibet*...(London: Doubleday, Page & Co., 1906); William Ottley, *With Mounted Infantry in Tibet* (London: Smith, Elder & Co., 1905); and L. Austine Waddell (his name is often given incorrectly as Augustine), *Lhasa and Its Mysteries: With a Record of the Expedition of 1903–1904* (London: John Murray and New York: Dutton, 1905). Waddell was officially the medical officer on the expedition, but went on to become the first university professor of Tibetan in Britain. Younghusband published his own *apologia* for the expedition, *India and Tibet*, in 1910.

Several later British officials also published accounts of their time in Tibet, including Charles Bell, *Portrait of a Dalai Lama: The Life and Times of the Great Thirteenth* (London: William Collins, 1946) and *Tibet Past and Present* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1924); David Macdonald, *Twenty Years in Tibet* (London: Seeley Service & Co., 1932); F. Spencer Chapman, *Lhasa: The Holy City* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1938). Hugh Richardson was a prolific scholar and researcher, but he wrote few personal accounts of his time in Tibet apart from the vignette, "The Chapel of the Hat," *Tibet Society Newsletter* (Summer 1983):14–16, republished in *High Peaks, Pure Earth* (London: Serindia, 1998), 726–28.

One account was published by an American: William Montgomery McGovern, *To Lhasa in Disguise: An Account of a Secret Expedition Through Mysterious Tibet* (1924; reprint, London: Kegan Paul, 2004). McGovern's criticisms of

the regime led the British to stop Western travelers going to Tibet unless they agreed to submit their texts for censorship; see Alex McKay, "'Truth,' Perception and Politics: The British Construction of an Image of Tibet," in Thierry Dodin and Heinz Räther, eds., *Imagining Tibet*, 67–90.

McKay also notes that there were scores of more junior British staff who served in Tibet whose impressions were never published: "Just as the British imperial process marginalised indigenous 'subaltern' voices, so too were the voices of British 'subalterns' marginalised. More than 100 British clerical, communications and medical staff served at the Trade Agencies. They include the Europeans who spent longest in Tibet (two British telegraph sergeants), and the European who spent the longest time in Lhasa (a British Radio Officer). But all three of these men were what the English call 'working class', and their names—Henry Martin, W. H. Luff, and Reginald Fox—have been forgotten by history" (McKay, "'Truth'," 74–75). The history of British officials in Tibet is discussed in detail in Alex McKay, *Tibet and the British Raj: The Frontier Cadre 1904–1947* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon Press, 1997).

The most substantial accounts of the Tibetan capital in the later decades of the twentieth century are those of Heinrich Harrer (*Seven Years in Tibet* [New York: Penguin, 1954]) and Robert Ford (*Wind Between the Worlds*), both of whom spoke Tibetan. Brief visits to Lhasa were described in Alexandra David-Néel, *My Journey to Lhasa* (New York: Harper, 1927; reprint, Boston: Beacon, 1986); Theos Bernard, *Penthouse of the Gods: A Pilgrimage Into the Heart of Tibet and the Sacred City of Lhasa* (New York: Scribners, 1940); and Lowell Thomas Jr., *Out of This World: Across the Himalayas to Forbidden Tibet* (New York: Greystone Press, 1950). The visit of two OSS officers in 1942 is documented in Rosemary Jones Tung, *Portrait of Lost Tibet: Photographs by Ilya Tolstoy and Brooke Dolan* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980).

In the 1950s and early 1960s a number of Western journalists sympathetic to the Chinese were allowed to visit Lhasa and published admiring accounts of contemporary reforms that they witnessed. These include Alan Winnington, *Tibet* (New York: International Publishers, 1957); Anna Louise Strong, *When Serfs Stood up in Tibet* (Beijing: New World Press, 1960); and Stuart and Roma Gelder, *Timely Rain Travels in New Tibet* (London: Hutchinson, 1964). Toward the end of the Cultural Revolution, sympathetic visitors were again allowed to visit Tibet, such as Han Suyin, who wrote *Lhasa, the Open City: A Journey to Tibet* (New York: Putnam, 1977) and Felix Greene, who produced a documentary film of his visit, *Tibet* (1976). See also Israel Epstein, *Tibet Transformed* (Beijing: New World Press, 1983), a polemical work based on three visits to Lhasa.

In the 1980s the most significant first-person account was by Catriona Bass, *Inside the Treasure House* (London: Gollancz, 1990); Bass spent a year teaching in Lhasa and spoke some Chinese and Tibetan. An important study was produced in French by Pierre Julien Quiers, *Histoires Tibétaines* (Paris: Éditions Florent-

Massot, 1997). See also Heinrich Harrer, *Return to Tibet—Tibet After the Chinese Occupation* (London: Phoenix, 1984) and Alec Le Sueur, *Running a Hotel on the Roof of the World* (London: Summersdale, 1998). The history of travel writers in Tibet has been discussed in Peter Hopkirk, *Trespassers on the Roof of the World: The Secret Exploration of Tibet* (Boston: J. P. Tarcher, 1982).

Page 27–28. **Descriptions oscillate between two extremes**: The oscillation of emotions in Western writings on Tibet has been noted by Bishop and by Lopez, who describes it thus: "Tibet's complexities and competing histories have been flattened into a stereotype. Stereotypes operate through adjectives, which establish chosen characteristics as if they were eternal truths....With sufficient repetition these adjectives become innate qualities, immune from history. And once these qualities harden into an essence, that essence may split into two opposing elements" (*Prisoners of Shangri-La* 10).

Page 28. **Dirt**: Manning, Landon, MacDonald, and Younghusband all refer copiously to what they saw as the filthiness of Lhasa and/or of Tibetans in general. Chapman's discussion of Tibetan dirtiness can be found in *Lhasa: The Holy City*, 145–46. Younghusband's description of the Tibetans as "obtuse and ignorant" and of the city streets as "filthy dirty, and the inhabitants hardly more clean than the streets" is in *India and Tibet*, 246–47. Waddell gives his view of Phari as perhaps the dirtiest town in the world in *Lhasa and Its Mysteries*, 100–101. He goes on to describe the women as "more like hideous gnomes than any human beings," and adds that none would be "so indiscreet as to wash."

The classical Chinese view of Tibetans may have been similar, according to a fourteenth-century Tibetan history that cites a Chinese aristocrat who described Tibet as "a place of outcasts, where there is no difference between clean and unclean." The history was written by Lama Dampa Sonam Gyaltsen (*Bla-ma dam pa* bSod-nams rgyal-mtshan) (1312–1375) and has been translated into English by Per K. Sørensen as *The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies—An Annotated Translation of the XIVth Century Tibetan Chronicle: rGyal-rabs gsal-ba'i me-long* (Asiastische Forshungen, Vol. 128, Wiesbaden: Harrasowitz Verlag, 1994), 230.

Visitors to Lhasa of less patrician origins do not seem to have mentioned dirt in their descriptions of the city. Phuntsog Wanggyal, the earliest Tibetan communist in Lhasa and by no means a sentimentalist, gives an extended description of the city after his first visit in 1943 without any reference to dirt. In fact, he specifically mentions "the smell of the incense in the Barkor" alongside other impressions that delighted him (Goldstein, Dawei Sherap, and Siebenschuh, *A Tibetan Revolutionary*, 69). In 1923 Alexandra David-Néel describes the streets of Lhasa as "relatively clean" (*My Journey* 273). Robert Ford, a long-term resident of Lhasa in the 1940s, and not in origin a member of the British officer class, also makes no mention of dirt or lack of hygiene; neither does Kimura. Both of them were fluent in Tibetan. Heinrich Harrer provides a useful discussion

concerning foreigners' complaints about Tibetan dirtiness in *Lost Lhasa* (New York: Abrams, 1992), 92–93.

The attitude of Westerners toward Tibetan hygiene is discussed in Bishop, *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 171, and in Robert Barnett, "A City, Its Visitors, and the Odour of Development," in Françoise Pommaret, ed., *Lhasa in the Seventeenth Century—The Capital of the Dalai Lamas* (Leiden: Brill, 2003), 199–226. The latter includes examples from Western "fellow-travelers" who visited Tibet in the 1960s, such as Anna Louise Strong and Stuart Gelder, who were disgusted by various smells and odors. For these writers, as for the English military writers who preceded them and the Chinese who followed them, an important purpose of their accounts was to convey their fortitude in overcoming the rigors of their journey to such a "remote" place. Tsering Shakya notes the legacy of Victorian travel writing in such accounts: "From Savage Landor onwards the great majority of western travel writers have sought to emphasise the difficulties of their journey and the uniqueness of their encounter with the Tibetan environment. What struck these writers was a combination of their personal fortitude and the exclusivity of their experience.... The travellers were struck primarily by the landscape, referring to the harshness of the environment and the splendour of the mountains. These they saw reflected in the essential nature of the Tibetan character and philosophy" ("Introduction: The Development of Modern Tibetan Studies," in Robert Barnett, ed., *Resistance and Reform in Tibet* [London: Christopher Hurst and Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994], 1–14).

Page 28. **Ants at work**: The tendency to describe Tibetan monks as ants is noted by Bishop, *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 170–71, where he cites, for example, Landon, *LHASA*, 2:283–84. Waddell more than once describes Tibetan soldiers, before they commenced battle, as resembling bees.

Page 28. **720 pounds of soap**: The figures for soap imports are given in Waddell's *Lhasa and Its Mysteries*, Appendix X, 476. He describes the discovery of soap in the soldiers' packs with some astonishment, and suggests that the relative cleanliness of the people in Lhasa itself might have been due to the coincidence of a recent rainstorm preceding his inspection (347). Nevertheless, he also notes that soap was available at "most of the stalls and has for years been one of the cheap imports," an observation that contradicts those of the French linguist and explorer Fernand Grenard, who wrote that he had found "a box containing six cakes of scented soap, which were the only specimens of soap that could be discovered within the radius of Lhasa in the month of January 1894 and which their purchaser was delighted to sell to us after having them for forty years in his shop" (*Le Tibet; le pays et les habitants* [Paris: Librairie Armand Colin, 1904]; published in English as *Tibet: The Country and Its Inhabitants* [London: Hutchinson & Co., 1904], 301; cited in Bishop, *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 154). Grenard in fact never reached Lhasa.

Page 28. **The British seem to have pillaged the corpses**: The looting and pillaging of treasures and manuscripts during the Younghusband campaign has

been discussed by Charles Allen in *Duel in the Snow*, where he cites Arthur Hadow's explicit descriptions of looting (224ff.). A more detailed discussion is given in Michael Carrington's article, "Officers, Gentlemen and Thieves: The Looting of Monasteries During the 1903/4 Younghusband Mission to Tibet," *Modern Asian Studies* 37, no. 1 (2003): 81–109. In *Twenty Years in Tibet*, the British official David Macdonald records that more than 400 mule-loads of "rare and valuable manuscripts of Lamaist sacred works, images, religious paraphernalia of all descriptions" collected by him and Waddell were brought back to India in 1904 (Allen, *Duel in the Snows*, 305–308).

Page 29. **The princess Pemá Chöki**: Maraini describes his journeys to Tibet and his meeting with the Princess of Sikkim in *Secret Tibet* (New York: Viking, 1952). For the description of the peas and his discussion of what he saw as an inexplicable relationship between the princess and the *gönkhangs*, see *Secret Tibet*, 48 and 51–53. Berenson's comments on Maraini's writings are on page xiii.

Page 31. **Contradictory emotions**: Landon's concessions to the potential worth of Tibetan Buddhism appear in *LHASA*, 2:190. The views on Tibetan Buddhism of Heinrich Hensoldt, a professor of Eastern religions in Germany and the author of "Occult Science in Tibet" (*Arena* 10 [1894]), are cited by Bishop in *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 169, as are those of the explorer Sven Hedin.

Page 31. **Three Russian rifles and a few cartridges**: The discovery of Russian rifles was reported by Landon, seemingly with some relief, in his article for *The Times* on the "regrettable" massacre at Chumik Shenko. "One most significant fact," he wrote, "is that three of the escort of the Tibetan general were armed with rifles bearing the Russian Imperial stamp. I have personally secured one from a dead Tibetan. Russian ammunition was also found" ("Latest Intelligence: The Mission to Tibet. Colonel Younghusband's Passage Opposed. Heavy Losses of the Tibetans," *The Times*, April 1, 1904). Allen discusses the issue in *Duel in the Snows*, 124. The stories of a Russian conspiracy to gain a foothold in Tibet had been based on the presence in Lhasa of the Buryat, Agwan Dorjief, whom *The Times* described as the "evil adviser" to the "dreamy and headstrong" Dalai Lama. The paper "fervently prayed" that the Dalai Lama was in his "final transmigration" (Editorial, August 13, 1904). Richardson later defended the British position, writing that the thirteenth Dalai Lama, while "rejecting Curzon's overtures, was busily exchanging amicable messages with the Czar" through Dorjief (*Tibet and Its History* 82–83). Richardson refers also to the "genuinely accepted...circumstantial rumours" of Russian arms consignments to Tibet.

Dorjief's role is discussed in John Snelling, *Buddhism in Russia: The Story of Agvan Dorzhiev, Lhasa's Emissary to the Tsar* (Boston: Element Books and Dorset: Shaftesbury, 1993); Alexandre Andreyev, "A Debacle of Secret Diplomacy," *The Tibet Journal* XXI, no. 3 (Autumn 1996): 4–34; Alexandre Andreyev, "Agwan Dorjiev's Secret Work in Russia and Tibet," *Tibetan Review* (September 1993): 11–14; Nicolai S. Kuleshov, "Agvan Dorjiev, the Dalai Lama's Ambassador," *Asian*

Affairs 23, no. 1 (1992): 20–33; and Nikolai S. Kuleshov, "Russia and Tibetan Crisis: Beginning at the Twentieth Century," *The Tibet Journal* XXI, no. 3 (Autumn 1996): 47–59.

Page 32. **Gunned down as they walked away**: A detailed account of the killings at Chumik Shenko carried out at the order of Francis Younghusband in 1904 is given in Charles Allen, "The Myth of Chumik Shenko," *History Today* 54, no. 4 (April 2004): 10–17. Younghusband himself used the term "massacre" in his private letters to describe the event. Accounts of the battle of Chumik Shenko (literally, "the crystal tears") differ widely in their explanations as to why so many Tibetans were killed for the loss of so few on the British side. Allen notes that there were intense arguments among the British soldiers during the night after the battle about how this had been allowed to happen. He provides some evidence that Arthur Hadow, one of the machine gunners, eventually pretended that his weapon had jammed rather than continue to obey orders to fire on the retreating Tibetans (*Duel in the Snows* 117–18).

Two fictionalized versions of the massacre at Chumik Shenko have appeared in Chinese, one a short story and the other a film, both with some attention to historical records of the incident. Both deal mainly with the Younghusband invasion and are much looser with historical materials. The short story is Ge Fei's *Encounter,* translated by Herbert Batt in Herbert Batt, ed., *Tales of Tibet: Sky Burials, Prayer Wheels and Wind Horses* (New York and Oxford: Rowman and Littlefield, 2001), 77–104. The film is *Hong he gu* (*Red River Valley*; 1997), directed by Feng Xiaoning. It is largely fanciful except for a reconstruction of the Chumik Shenko massacre. There is also a novel about the British invasion by Yeshe Tenzin, *Sword in Snowy Twilight* (Lhasa: Tibetan People's Publishing House, 1996).

Page 32. **Cajoled to give up their defensive positions**: Candler reported that in the build-up to the battle of Chumik Shenko, the Tibetans were "quietly induced to retire" from their defensive positions (*The Times*, April 1, 1904). Waddell says that the Sepoys physically pushed the Tibetans out of their *sangars* or defensive positions overlooking the British during the negotiations, indicating that the British thus replaced the Tibetans on the hillsides (*Lhasa and Its Mysteries* 156–61). The Tibetan soldiers were under strict orders from Lhasa not to fire unless fired upon, and were led by the British to believe that their generals would hold negotiations. Chinese histories claim that the British soldiers each removed a bullet from their rifles and so tricked the Tibetans into extinguishing the fuses on their muskets, since the Tibetans did not realize the British rifles could instantly be reloaded (Xirab Nyima in Wang and Nima Jianzhan, *The Historical Status of Tibet*, chapter VI, part 8).

Page 32. **Lost only 34 of them in battle**: Waddell notes that the expedition had 16 engagements, which resulted in 202 casualties to his men, of whom 23 were officers. He does not give a figure for deaths except to say that five of the wounded officers died (*Lhasa and Its Mysteries* 442). Charles Allen cites the

official death count on the British side as 34, of whom 29 were "natives," meaning Indians or Nepalis. Several soldiers died of frostbite, but their numbers are not given. Thousands of pack animals perished—of 3,500 yaks, for example, only 150 survived (Bishop, *The Myth of Shangri-La*, 152, citing Candler, *Lhasa*, 86–87). Xirab Nyima's chapter in *The Historical Status of Tibet* claims that 280 British troops were killed in one skirmish alone and 121 in another, but this seems unlikely (Wang and Nima Jianzhan, *The Historical Status of Tibet*, chapter VI, section 8).

Page 32. **"I went off alone to the mountainside"**: Francis Younghusband's epiphany as he departed from Tibet is described in *India and Tibet*, 305.

Page 35. **"Is there no light that cuts through the demonic darkness"**: The missionary pamphlet calling on evangelists to go to Tibet was produced by a fundamentalist Protestant missionary organization called The Sowers' Ministry in the early 1990s. Founded in Nepal in 1986 by Americans born in India who were ordained in Texas, it mainly targets people in Nepal, India, Tibet, China, and Bhutan. It describes itself as a "mission organization involved in evangelism, training and church planting [whose] goal is to preach Christ where His name is not known and plant churches," though it also invites followers to "pray against the spreading of Tibetan Buddhism into other countries" (www.sowers.org/test-tibet.html). The text of the pamphlet is reproduced as an appendix to my article on Protestant missionaries in Tibet in that period; see Robert Barnett, "Saving Tibet from 'Satan's Grip': Present-Day Missionary Activity in Tibet," *Lungta 11: Christian Missionaries and Tibet* (Winter 1998):36–41.

The history of early Catholic missionaries has been studied by Luciano Petech in *I missionari italiani,* by Wessels in *Early Jesuit Travellers,* and by Vannini in *The Bell*. There is an extensive literature on Protestant missionaries in the Himalayan areas, including several short studies by John Bray, such as "Christian Missions and the Politics of Tibet, 1850–1950," in Wilfried Wagner, ed., *Kolonien und Missionen—Referate des 3. Internationalen Kolonialgeschichtlichen Symposiums 1993 in Bremen* (Bremer Asien-Pazifik Studien, vol. 12, Bremen: Universität Bremen, n.d.), 180–95. Several autobiographical accounts have been published by missionaries who worked in the Tibetan borderlands in the 1940s and early 1950s, including George Patterson. He worked first as a Protestant missionary in Bathang in eastern Tibet and then, in a remarkable move, offered himself for many years as an unofficial liaison between the Tibetan rebel army and the CIA. His experiences are described in several books, including George Patterson, *God's Fool* (London: Faber and Faber, 1956).

The most famous Tibetan convert to Christianity was Tharchin *babu*, who was converted by Moravians in Kinnaur, northern India, and later ordained a Minister of the Church of Scotland Mission in Kalimpong, West Bengal. For over thirty years, Tharchin produced an influential Tibetan-language newspaper called *Sargyur Melong* or *The Mirror*. The paper helped Kalimpong become a center for exiled Tibetan progressives in the middle decades of the twentieth

century. See H. Louis Fader, *The Life and Times of a True Son of Tibet, Gergan Dorje Tharchin* (Kalimpong: Tibet Mirror Press, 2002).

Page 36. **They do not have the words of any God to help them**: In his early writings Wang Lixiong, a noted Chinese intellectual and critic of Beijing's Tibet policies, described pre–1980 leftist policies as relatively effective in Tibet because they had been able, in effect, to replace one god with another: "It was impossible to overthrow centuries of worship without playing the role of a new god....It was simply that Mao had replaced the Dalai Lama as the god in their minds." Since after liberalization this option no longer remained, Wang suggests that the problem can only be resolved by including the Dalai Lama: "Today, the person who controls the two banners [of religion and nationality] is none other than the Dalai Lama.... With the Tibetan populace coalesced behind these banners, there existed no opposition force that could counter the exiled deity. Only Mao had succeeded in dissolving the religious and ethnic unity of the Tibetans, by introducing the element of class struggle. Renouncing this without creating any new ideology has left a vacuum that can only be filled by a combination of lamaist tradition and ethnic nationalism." Wang Lixiong, "Reflections on Tibet," *New Left Review* 14 (March–April 2002).

Page 37. **Translation of works from Chinese**: The question of Tibet's cultural or religious links with China has not been much studied by Western scholars of religion and culture apart from a major work by Gray Tuttle, *Tibetan Buddhists in the Making of Modern China* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005). Tuttle documents the rapid emergence of Chinese interest in Tibetan Buddhism in the 1920s, at the same time that Chinese nationalist leaders—some of whom also became Tibetan Buddhist devotees—were looking for ways to refashion China as a modern nation-state and to encourage the integration of Tibet within it.

R. A. Stein notes in his *Tibetan Civilization* (translated from the French by J. E. Stapleton Driver, London: Faber, 1972) that there were translations of Chinese works into Tibetan in the eighth and ninth centuries (59), as do many Chinese authors. Buddhism had come to China much earlier than to Tibet, and later Tibetan literature explains the absence of Chinese influence in Tibet after the eighth century mainly by referring to accounts of a debate staged by the Tibetan king Trisong Detsen in about 792. The debate was between Indian and Chinese Buddhist scholars and was held to decide which school should be followed in Tibet. Most Tibetan histories, such as the fourteenth-century *Bu ston chos 'byung*, say that it was won by the Indians and that the Chinese protagonists were expelled from the country, along with their texts. Some other histories, such as the *Nyang chos 'byung*, say that the main Chinese scholar was not penalized and that the Tibetans continued to revere him (see Pasang Wangdu with Hildegard Diemberger [translators], *dBa' bzhed: The Royal Edict Concerning the Bringing of Buddha's Doctrine to Tibet* [Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2000], 88*n*331). The *Dba' bzhed,* a history dating probably from

the tenth century, ends, in one version, with the same king who had earlier decided to only have texts from India translated saying a few years later, "I regret the fact that the doctrinal scriptures of China were not translated." Matthew Kapstein has given a detailed account of the Tibetan borrowings from Indian literary culture in "The Indian Literary Identity in Tibet" in Sheldon Pollock, ed., *Literary Cultures in History: Reconstructions from South Asia* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003).

Page 37. **An innovative and irrefutable division of time**: The politics of periodization have been studied by a number of writers, in particular, in the Chinese context, by Prasenjit Duara in *Rescuing History from the Nation: Questioning Narratives of Modern China* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1995), where he describes periodization "as rhetorical strategies to conceal the aporias and repressions necessitated by the imposition of a master narrative" (27–28; also cited in Tuttle, "Modern Tibetan Historiography," *Papers on Chinese History* [Spring 1998]:104). See also Prasenjit Duara, "The Régime of Authenticity: Timelessness, Gender, and National History in Modern China," *History and Theory* 37, no. 3 (1998): 287–308, and Jonathan Unger, ed., *Using the Past to Serve the Present: Historiography and Politics in Contemporary China* (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1993), which includes Geremie R. Barmé's essay, "History for the Masses." Soviet approaches to time divisions in historiography are discussed in Cyril E. Black, *Rewriting Russian History: Soviet Interpretations of Russia's Past* (New York: Vintage, 1962). Q. Edward Wang discusses Chinese Marxist historians in "Between Marxism and Nationalism: Chinese Historiography and the Soviet Influence, 1949–1963," *Journal of Contemporary China* 9, no. 23 (March 1, 2000): 95–111. A discussion of this issue in another field can be found in Linda Georgianna, "Periodization and Politics: The Case of the Missing Twelfth Century in English Literary History," *Modern Language Quarterly* 64, no. 2 (June 1, 2003): 153–68 (16).

Page 38. **The ruling that practice rather than Mao's dictums should be the "sole criterion of truth"**: The 1978 decision by the Chinese Communist Party on "practice as truth" led to the passage of a "Resolution on Certain Historical Issues Concerning the Party Since the Founding of New China" in June 1981. The resolution ruled that Mao had been correct 70 percent of the time. It in effect formalized the end of the previous era and marked the third Plenum of the eleventh Congress as the moment of transition from that era to the next.

Page 38. **Tibetan leaders appointed during the Cultural Revolution**: The two Tibetan leaders who survived the purge of leftist officials and the fall of the Gang of Four in October 1976 were Ragti and Pasang (the names are romanized in Chinese publications as Raidi and Basang). Ragti had been made the equivalent of a party secretary of the TAR in 1975, and in 1977 had been placed on the Central Committee of the national CCP. He remained in these positions until after the turn of the millennium. Pasang had become a vice chairwoman of the newly established TAR Revolutionary Committee in September 1968. In 1971 she was made a deputy party secretary in the TAR Party Committee, a position

she held until her retirement in 2002. She had been given a national position on the CCP Central Committee in 1973 and had served continuously until her retirement. Tsering Shakya, in *The Dragon in the Land of Snows,* discusses the explanation given by Hu Yaobang at the Second National Work Forum in 1984 for keeping these two Tibetans in their positions despite their Cultural Revolution associations: "It was clear that even the most liberal leader was not prepared to carry out a purge of Tibetan leftists, perhaps because…only those Tibetans who had gained most under the Communists could be relied upon to support Beijing" (349, 365–66).

Page 39. **Participants whose memories are more likely to be ordered by experience**: The tenth Panchen Lama, the most important Tibetan dignitary to have remained within China after 1959, gave a famous speech to officials in Shigatse in January 1989, a few days before he died, which summarized Tibetan experience without allowing for any temporal divisions since 1951. According to Isabel Hilton in her book *The Search for the Panchen Lama* (London: Viking, 1999), his actual words were: "Since liberation, there has certainly been development, but the price paid for this development has been greater than the gains" (194). The remark was one of the rare occasions when a Tibetan within Tibet referred publicly to modern history without using the years 1978 or 1980 to mark a radical break in time.

3. THE SQUARE VIEW AND THE OUTSTRETCHED DEMONESS

Page 41. **"To the east, in China, is the king of divination"**: Stein's summary of what he called "the square-based view," based on his study of Tibetan histories dating from the twelfth to the seventeenth centuries, is given in *Tibetan Civilization,* 39. The description of the four kings given here is an abbreviated version of F. W. Thomas's translation of a section of the *Rgyal po bka' thang,* dating from before the fifteenth century, cited in Stein, *Recherches sur l'Épopée et le Barde au Tibet* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1959), 244. Stein noted that the scheme appeared in eleventh-century poems by Milarepa. Geza Uray later noted that it also exists in the Dunhuang manuscripts from the dynastic era (the seventh to the ninth centuries), as he demonstrated in his article, "*Vom Römischen Kaiser bis zum König Gesar von gLing,*" in Walther Heissig, *Fragen der Mongolischen Heldendichtung* (Wiesbaden: Harrasowitz Verlag, 1982), 3:530–48.

The fourfold pattern is found repeatedly in Tibetan historical texts, such as those describing the leaders of the twelve tribes when they welcomed the first Tibetan king descending from the sky, the four tribes that formed the early army, the four tributary kings conquered by Trisong Detsen in the early ninth century, and the four horns or banners that were used for military administration in the dynastic era. In Buddhist thought the scheme related to the Protector Kings of the Four Directions, and in Buddhist geomancy it related often to the eight-spoked wheel and the eight-petaled lotus. Stein also notes that this

horizontal view was often combined (as in an offering mandala) with a vertical model that had three levels (often sky, earth, and "the world under the earth") or, at other times, seven levels (*Tibetan Civilization* 41).

Page 43. "**The heart of the continent, the source of all rivers**": An alternative translation of the dynastic-era poem describing Tibet as the central realm is given in David Snellgrove and Hugh Richardson, *A Cultural History of Tibet* (Boston: Shambhala, 1995): "This centre of heaven, / This core of earth, / This heart of the world, / Fenced round by snow, / The headland of all rivers, / Where the mountains are high and the land is pure...." Another poem from the same period goes: "From mid-sky, seven stage high, / Heavenly sphere, azure blue, / Came our King, Lord of men, Sun divine, to Tibet. / Land so high, made so pure, / Without equal, without peer, / Land indeed! Best of all! Religion too surpassing all!" (*Cultural History* 23, 24).

Page 43. **Their perception of themselves was reordered**: The view of Tibetans as northern savages and the relocation of their spiritual focus to the south are associated with specific moments in Tibetan history. One of these is the decision after the death of the Tibetan monarch Trisong Detsen in about 802 that Buddhist rather than Bonpo rites should be performed at the royal funeral. According to the *Dba' bzhed*, the debate was held between the Buddhist scholar Vairocana and the Bon minister Chimtsen zherlegzig (mChims bTsan zher legs gzigs) in front of the new king, Mu-ne tsenpo. The arguments of the two protagonists were in part geomantic, since they concerned which geographic site offered the greatest source of power to the kingdom. The Bon minister said that Yarlha shampo, a mountain deity in Tibet, "was very mighty and had great magic powers," while Vairocana responded that the temple of Nalendra in India was "more auspicious" and that Buddhist protectors were "possessed with greater magic." The new king accepted Vairocana's view (Pasang Wangdu and Diemberger, *dBa' bzhed*, 98–100). This account of the debate suggests that at least by the tenth century, there was a view in Tibet that retrospectively projected the notional source of moral authority to the south.

Page 44. **"The Emperor looked at mGar with piercing eyes"**: The story of the visit of Minister mGar to the court of the Tang Emperor Taizong in 640–41 to seek a princess as a bride for the Tibetan King Srongtsen Gampo is told in many medieval Tibetan chronicles and histories, notably the *Ma Ni bka' 'bum* (eleventh century), the *Bka' chems ka khol ma*, the *Rgyal-rabs gsal-ba'i me-long* (1368), and the opera text *Rgya-bza' bal-bza'i rnam-thar* (probably sixteenth century). These histories also describe a series of tests that the emperor (629–649) sets for the minister and for competing suitors from other realms. The extracts here, which I have heavily abbreviated, are from Per Sørensen's annotated translation of the *Rgyal-rabs gsal-ba'i me-long*, known in English as *The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies*, and written by *Bla-ma dam pa* bSod-nams rgyal-mtshan, who lived from 1312 to 1375. The courtesan's explanation of Chinese views of Tibet and the emperor's mocking response to mGar are given in Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 224 and 217.

The self-deprecating account of Tibet given in the Tibetan sources is a rhetorical strategy by the writers: all the Tibetan texts show mGar as finally outwitting the emperor and winning the grudging admiration of the court. They also show him outwitting the Four Kings of the Four Directions, despite the fact that they are more powerful than the Tibetans by any material or physical measure. mGar arrives at the court at the same time as four ministers representing the King of Religion from India, Gesar the King of War, the King of Wealth from Persia, and the Turkic-Uighur King of Hor, and all of them have come with the same request: a Chinese princess to marry to their monarch. Historically it was in fact the case that the Tibetans had been outmaneuvered in obtaining princesses from the Chinese court by the Turks and the Tu-yu-hun, a people in the Kokonor or Qinghai area. This is discussed in Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating, n*614, and Christopher I. Beckwith, *The Tibetan Empire in Central Asia: A History of the Struggle for Great Power Among the Tibetans, Turks, Arabs, and Chinese During the Early Middle Ages* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987).

In the version given in the *The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies*, the four powerful ministers take up their respective positions outside each of the gates of city at its cardinal points. The Tibetans have to pitch their tents between the northern and the eastern gates—not a cardinal point. Thus China becomes, in this account, the center of the Tibetan square (Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 216), as it was to remain for much of subsequent history. The Tibetan accounts do not ignore Tibetan proficiency in some areas, and mention the excellence of technological skill at the time in metalwork, particularly in the production of armor, weapons, and golden utensils; mGar is supposed to have presented a lapis lazuli coat of mail to the emperor. When mGar finally outwits the other ministers in the tests set by the emperor, he is described as riding his horse around the defeated delegations, saying, "We Tibetans surpass you Indians and Hor people! We shall [take] the princess, so all of you sit down and place your fingers to your mouths!" (Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 229).

In the earliest extant Tibetan account of mGar's visit to the Chinese court to ask for a princess—the Tibetan history known as the *Dba' bzhed*—there is no mention of any tests of the ministers' wits. Instead, the three pre-written letters, and the Tibetans' ability to predict the Chinese emperor's demands, are sufficient evidence for the emperor to tell his daughter, "Consider the bTsan po [Emperor] of Tibet and the Emperor of China as equals" (Pasang Wangdu and Diemberger, *dBa' bzhed,* 30–31).

Page 45. **Tibetans have not drawn much upon the earlier history of Tibet**: Tibet's imperial might between the seventh and ninth centuries did not disappear from political memory during subsequent periods, but it seems to have been used somewhat sparingly as a nation-building device, and only by the most powerful of Tibetan rulers. Its use is associated, for example, with the fourteenth-century Phagmodrupa power holder in Tibet, Changchub Gyaltsen. Giuseppe Tucci, in *Tibetan Painted Scrolls* (Rome: Librera dello Stato, 1949), saw

the practice of discovering *terma* (*gter-ma*) or "hidden treasures" (sacred documents or objects said to have been written centuries earlier) from the twelfth century onward as a way of referring to the dynastic period. "It was his aim to give Tibet a political consciousness, to pacify internal struggles which had turned it asunder so long, to free it from subjection to China. He aspired to restore the ancient kings' monarchic ideal, to revive national law and customs, and he enacted a code by which up to our days justice is administered in Tibet.... This conscious rebirth of ancient traditions...was attended not only by a renewal of historical studies and a vast production of chronicles, but also by research for documents, real or presumed, which might revive, as a reminder, the age of the kings," wrote Tucci (*Tibetan Painted Scrolls* I:23–24).

In the late seventeenth century the fifth Dalai Lama and his regent, Sangye Gyatso, explicitly intended their rebuilding of the Potala Palace to be an evocation of Srongtsen Gampo's era, when the first version of the palace was said to have been erected. As Samten Karmay wrote, "the completion of the building of the Potala as the seat of government [represented] this motivation to restore in a certain sense the former imperial power" ("The Rituals and Their Origins in the Visionary Accounts of the Fifth Dalai Lama," in H. Blezer, ed., *Religion and Secular Culture in Tibet* [Leiden/Boston/Köln: Brill, 2002], 28). The same view is expressed by Hugh Richardson in "The Fifth Dalai Lama's Decree Appointing Sang-rgyas rgya-mtsho as Regent" in *High Peaks*, 448. But sustained references by later rulers to the earlier, more powerful epoch of Tibetan history seem generally to have taken second place to claims of religious legitimacy, usually deriving from connections with India.

Page 48. **"On one auspicious day, at the height of summer"**: Tiley Chodag's description of the founding of Lhasa is taken from his popular summary of Tibetan folklore, translated by W. Tailing and published as *Tibet: The Land and the People* (Beijing: New World Press, 1988). Chodag, born in 1937, studied at Sera monastery until 1953, when he went to study in Beijing at the Central Minorities Institute. He returned to Lhasa in 1958 and worked as an editor at the Tibet People's Press, where he translated the eight main Tibetan opera texts into Chinese and wrote about Tibetan culture and folklore.

Page 50. **The predetermined process of social evolution**: The view of nationalities and peoples as evolving through a series of preordained stages is associated with the American lawyer and anthropologist Lewis Henry Morgan (1818–81), whose theory of cultural evolution or "social Darwinism" viewed human societies as "progressing" in turn through seven stages, of which the main categories were the savage, the barbaric, and the civilized. Marx's comments on the theory were used by Engels in his work *The Origins of the Family, Private Property, and the State* (1884), and these later influenced Chinese Marxist thinking, generating a stage theory of evolution that was particularly significant in China's assessments of non-Chinese nationalities within its borders. These views were later taken up by Fei Xiaotong, China's leading anthropologist, and by the state.

According to Ma Yin, ed., *China's Minority Nationalities* (Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1989), an official handbook, "the social and economic development of the Han people in 1949 was more highly developed than that of most of the minorities.... In China before liberation the minorities presented...an illustration of social development in four different socio-economic forms. A feudal landlord economy was practised, as a rule, by those groups that had social and economic structures largely identical with those of the Han. Contrasting with these were a few others that still lived under a feudal serf system or with slavery (Tibetans and Yis); vestiges of primitive communal society were even found among many of the small, primitive tribes" (4–5).

For further details see Gregory E. Guldin, *The Saga of Anthropology in China: From Malinowski to Moscow to Mao* (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1994); Dru C. Gladney, "Representing Nationality in China: Refiguring Majority/Minority Identities," *Journal of Asian Studies* 53, no. 1 (1994): 92–123; Barry Sautman, "Myths of Descent, Racial Nationalism and Ethnic Minorities in the People's Republic of China," in Frank Dikötter, ed., *The Construction of Racial Identities in China and Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1997), 75–95; and Stevan Harrell, "The Anthropology of Reform and the Reform of Anthropology: Anthropological Narratives of Recovery and Progress in China," *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30 (October 2001): 139–61.

Page 50. **"The cultivation of radishes and turnips"**: In the version of the Princess Wencheng story given in *The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies,* the princess, before leaving for Tibet, asks if the Tibetans already have porcelain clay, silkworm fodder, rose trees, and turnips. The minister mGar replies, "Turnip is not found, but the other things we have," and the narrator adds, "wherefore [it was decided to] take along seeds of radish and turnip" (Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 223).

Page 50. **The official view of the princess...an industry of its own**: The story of Princess Wencheng's marriage to Srongtsen Gampo has been used as a basis for numerous operas, films, paintings, songs, and literature in China since 1950, and giant statues were erected in the 1990s along the route of her journey from China to Lhasa. Hers is the main story used officially in modern China to describe the Sino-Tibetan relationship. Most if not all of this cultural production is state-sponsored, and in 1986 a play by Huang Zhilong, *Srongtsen Gampo,* was banned by the government, apparently because it failed to emphasize sufficiently the role of Wencheng (see Robert Barnett, "The Secret Secret: Cinema, Ethnicity and Seventeenth-Century Tibetan-Mongolian Relations," *Inner Asia* [Winter 2002]: 277–346).

An account of the cultural politics in post–1950 China that led to the official promotion of stories about the ancient practice of *heqin* or political marriage, and of some of the uses of the Wencheng story, is given in Uradyn Bulag, "Naturalizing National Unity: Political Romance and the Chinese Nation," in *The Mongols at China's Edge: History and the Politics of National Unity* (Lanham, MD: Rowman

& Littlefield, 2002), 63–102. Bulag describes the Chinese Premier Zhou Enlai's efforts to get a drama written about the Wencheng story immediately after the uprising in Tibet in March 1959. A twenty-part television drama describing her life in Tibet was produced as *Wencheng Gonjo* (*Rgya bza' gong jo* in Tibetan, or *Princess Wencheng* in English) by Central China Television in 2000; the series, which seems not to have been well received among educated Tibetans, depicts her as a didactic bringer of civilization to backward Tibetans.

This claim does have some historical foundation—*The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies* records that Wencheng offered the Tibetans "worldly affairs and architectural refinements, various ways of preparing dishes of food, ornamental design, [and] merits [derived from] tilling and grinding alien harvests" (Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 247). *The Mirror* also describes specific techniques she is said to have introduced—recipes for curd, butter, and cheese; techniques for pounding rosewood, for making rope from hemp, for making earthenware, for planting turnips, and for setting up watermills (248). But in that text it seems that these are all intended to be understood as embellishments of existing cultural practices, not as innovations.

Page 55. **"The eastern mountain peaks rise in waves"**: Wencheng's poem about the mountains around Lhasa can be found in Tiley Chodag, *Tibet: The Land,* 79, and in Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 260–61. In the latter text Wencheng is described as recognizing a complex series of geomantic forces in the landscape, only some of which relate to the demoness. She identifies not only the three hillocks within the Lhasa valley area that are the "heart bones" (*snying khrag*) of the demoness but also the doors to the caverns or sleeping places of the *nāga*s, the tree that is a meeting place of spirits, the path of the *btsan*-spirits, the five mountains that are *sa dra* (terrestrial antagonists), the four mountains that resemble auspicious signs, the eight mountains bearing each of the eight auspicious symbols, and the four places that each hold or represent supplies of different precious metals. The *Bka' chems ka khol ma* gives a fuller description of Wencheng's recognition of the eight-spoked wheel and the eight-petaled lotus formed by the mountains around Lhasa, and of the five "antagonists" that have to be subdued (see Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating,* 553–60). At least according to these post-tenth century texts, it seems that the technology the Tibetans mainly wanted from China was skill in geomantic divination.

Page 55. **The outstretched *srinmo* or demoness**: The recognition of the inner hillocks or spurs of the Lhasa Valley—Marpori, Chagpori, and Bemari—as the breasts and genitals of the prostrate *srinmo* or demoness is not found specifically in *The Mirror Illuminating the Royal Genealogies*. But another chronicle, the *Bka' chems ka khol ma*, says, "the three parts of hillocks towering [around Lhasa] are known to be the nipples of her breast and the vein of the life [force] of the demoness.... dMar-po-ri and lCags-kha-ri, the two, resemble the tail of a lion [and a tiger] tied together. These two...are the heart-bones of the demoness, recognized to devour the life of sentient beings" (Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminat-*

ing, 556). This text does not name Bemari as the third hill, but this is clarified by Keith Dowman, *The Power-Places of Central Tibet* (London: Routledge, 1988). Dowman notes that Bemari is variously spelled *dbong po ri*, *bong pa ri*, or *spar ma ri*, and that it can also be pronounced "Bompori" or "Bhamari" (284); it is consequently sometimes confused with the more prominent Bumpari, one of the eight mountains surrounding Lhasa. An influential interpretation of the *srinmo* myth is given by Janet Gyatso in her article, "Down with the Demoness: Reflections on a Feminine Ground in Tibet," *The Tibet Journal* XII, no. 4 (Winter 1987): 38–53, also published in Janice Willis, ed., *Feminine Ground: Essays on Women and Tibet* (Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion, 1989).

Page 55. **A series of nesting squares**: The system of the Thandul (*mtha' 'dul*) and the Yangdul (*yang 'dul*) temples that pin down the demoness is discussed in detail in Michael Aris, *Bhutan: The Early History of a Himalayan Kingdom* (Warminster: Aris and Philips, 1979), 3–33, and in Sørensen, *Mirror Illuminating*, notes 770–78 and 832–58 to the main text, and note 770 in the appendix (pp. 561–77). There are multiple versions of the demoness story, of which the earliest so far discovered is probably the *Ma Ni bka' 'bum* (eleventh century). Several name the first set of four temples, with some variations, as Katsel (Ka rtsal) in Medrogongkar county (this is in the central *ru* or horn) pinning down the right shoulder; Trandrug (Khra 'brug) in Nedong county (in the left *ru*) pinning down the left shoulder; Tsangdrang (Gtsang 'phrang) in Namling county (in the right *ru*) pinning down the right hip; and Drumpa Gyang (Grum pa rgyang) in Lhatse county (in the *ru lag* or western *ru* of Tsang) holding down the left hip. Diagrams or pictures illustrating the demoness or the squares pinning her down are given in Dowman, *Power-Places*, 284; Victor Chan, *The Tibet Handbook: A Pilgrim's Guide* (Chicago: Moon Publications, 1994), 44; and Pommaret, ed., *Lhasa in the Seventeenth Century*, 17.

The *Dba' bzhed*, which could be a century earlier than the *Ma Ni bka' 'bum*, refers to a similar scheme, but it says that this consisted of 42 temples built by Srongtsen Gampo. It implies that they were built before the king sent mGar to sue for the hand of Princess Wencheng (Pasang Wangdu and Diemberger, *dBa' bzhed*, 26 and 30–32). Some other texts refer to attempts to establish 108 temples in this period, while others say that some of the temples were built a century later. Most writers agree that these temples were related to the system of the four *ru* or horns—these were the main units in the administration of central Tibet during the period of the Tibetan Kingdom. This connection is noted in Stein, *Tibetan Civilization*, 40ff. See also Geza Uray, "The Four Horns According to the Royal Annals," *Acta Orientalia Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* X:31–57; and Robert J. Miller, "'The Supine Demoness' (Srin mo) and the Consolidation of Empire," in Alex McKay, ed., *The History of Tibet* (London: Curzon, 2003), 336–53.

Page 56. **The name Lhasa, the place of the Gods**: The term "Lhasa" is first encountered on the pillar bearing the text of the Sino-Tibetan treaty of 822. This

was placed at the foot of the Marpori, the Red Hill, on which the Potala Palace was built. In that text and in some later documents the name Lhasa referred only to the Jokhang. Before 822 the name Rasa had been used. *Ra* is the Tibetan word for goat, and this name is understood by later writers to have meant "the place of the goats," because white goats were used to carry the earth for the foundations of the Jokhang. Anne Marie Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso suggest that "Rasa" may have been a contraction of *rawe sa*, "a place surrounded by a wall" ("Lhasa, Legend and History," in Pommaret, ed., *Lhasa in the Seventeenth Century*, 15–38; the discussion of Lhasa's names is at 21–22).

Page 56. **The persistent problem of water**: The constant danger of flooding throughout Lhasa's history, and the prophecies connected to that threat, are discussed in Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso ("Lhasa, Legend" 29–31). They note that the biographies of many lamas describe their efforts, practical or mystical, to maintain the dikes. In particular, according to his biography, a "treasure-finder" lama called Zhikpo Lingpa built a temple in Lhasa in 1554 that was designed to protect the city from floods. The temple seems not to have been powerful enough, because in 1562 the Kyichu burst its dikes and flooded the town, motivating Sonam Gyatso (1543–88), later to be recognized as the third Dalai Lama, to establish the practice of the Drepung monks reinforcing the dikes on the last day of the Great Prayer Ceremony each spring. This was done every year until recent times ("Lhasa, Legend" 36). Although ten feet thick, the dikes could not withstand the monsoon rains and would collapse each year. In the 1940s, at the request of the Tibetan government, Heinrich Harrer and Peter Aufschnaiter built a new, longer-lasting dike system with a sloping earthen wall, using up to 700 laborers at a time (Harrer, *Lost Lhasa*, 74–77).

The history of the Lhalu (or Lhaklu) pasture land and a discussion of its environmental qualities is given in Emily Yeh, "The Lhalu Wetland Nature Reserve: Land Use Change and State Environmentalism in Lhasa, Tibet," paper presented during the panel "The Construction of Nature Reserves in Western China," Association of Asian Studies Annual Meeting, New York, March 2003.

Page 57. **Not the political capital or administrative center of the country**: From the fall of the Tibetan line of kings in 842 until the accession of the fifth Dalai Lama in 1642, Lhasa's significance was religious rather than political, since in that period power moved to different areas within the central region as different local princes or lamas vied to become the dominant leader in Tibet. After the end of the royal dynasty, Lhasa thus declined as a city or physical center for more than a century, and it is not clear when lay buildings were erected besides the Jokhang, the Ramoche, and the other temples built near them. There was certainly a palace on the Marpori in Lhasa (the hill now dominated by the Potala) in the seventh or eighth century, known as the Lha sa'i sku mkhar and mentioned in the *Dba' bzhed* (Pasang Wangdu and Diemberger, *Dba' bzhed*, 46). But many visitors and inhabitants may have lived in tents, and some of the kings may not have had fixed residences during the dynastic era, since they moved frequently

and had palaces elsewhere. The physical shape of the town before the seventeenth century is not clearly documented. But it is probable that by then "a town was built up gradually around these prestigious monuments, accommodating the craftsmen who worked on their improvements" and those who catered to the pilgrim trade as well as to the monasteries founded by Tsongkhapa and his followers (Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso, "Lhasa, Legend," 25ff.).

Except in the anti-Buddhist period of the late ninth and early tenth centuries, when it is said that the Jokhang and the Ramoche were turned into stables, Lhasa must have remained a place of exceptional importance to Tibetans. One of the stone pillars engraved with the text of the Sino-Tibetan peace treaty of 822 was placed there, the great Bengali Buddhist teacher Atisha taught there for some time before his death in 1054, Gompa Tsultrim Rinchen (1116–62) restored the Jokhang in the twelfth century, and his student Lama Zhang founded the monasteries of Tsel (1175) and Gungthang (1187), some 7 miles east of Lhasa, to ensure the protection of the city's temples (Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso, "Lhasa, Legend," 25–31).

The increasing importance of the town in medieval times is further shown by Tsongkhapa's choice of Lhasa as the site for his main monasteries. The most powerful town at that time in political terms was Ne'udong, but he chose the slope of the mountain to the north of Lhasa, where Sera is now, for a retreat, and while there had a vision that led him to establish the *Mönlam chenmo* or Great Prayer Ceremony at the Jokhang.

The festival was held for the first time in 1409, after the temple's interior and statues had been refurbished; it lasted 16 days and is said to have attracted 10,000 people. The event became an important factor in Lhasa's revival in the fifteenth century and remained the city's principal calendrical event until it was banned by the Chinese state in 1959. The other major factor in the revival of Lhasa was the founding of the three great monasteries of Ganden, Drepung, and Sera in 1409, 1416, and 1419 respectively. The first was established by Tsongkhapa himself; Drepung and Sera were established by his disciples (Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso, "Lhasa, Legend," 33–35). The Dalai Lama lineage was based in Drepung monastery, from where it built up major relations with the most powerful khans in Mongolia. Lhasa became a political center again and a built city after Gushri Khan enthroned the fifth Dalai Lama as the head of the Tibetan government, then based in Drepung, in 1642. The Dalai Lama began the construction of the Potala Palace, later the seat of the government, three years later.

Page 57. **They considered the city to be almost totally devoid of men**: The population of Lhasa in 1904 was estimated by the British at 30,000 people, of whom 20,000 were said to be monks. This claim is discussed in Blondeau and Yonten Gyatso, "Lhasa, Legend," 26. In 1936 Spencer Chapman estimated the population at 50,000 to 60,000, consisting of 20,000 residents and 30,000 to 40,000 monks, according to Ma Rong, "Han and Tibetan Residential Patterns in Lhasa" (*China Quarterly* 128 [December 1991]: 814–36). Ma suggests that the

population in 1952 was approximately the same as in Chapman's day. In 1986 the official population of Lhasa was 107,725, and 52.5 percent of the 72,349 Chinese in the TAR—about 38,000—were living in the city (832, 815). These sources do not specify the number of nuns.

4. THE CITY, THE CIRCLE

Page 65. **The constant risk of being kidnapped by senior monks**: Tashi Tsering's accounts of his attempts to avoid kidnapping by monks in the 1950s are given in his autobiography (*The Struggle for Modern Tibet* 26–30). The issue is also discussed in the biography of the former *dobdob* Tashi Khedup, published in English as Tashi Khedrup, *Adventures of a Fighting Monk*. See also Melvyn Goldstein, "A Study of the *Ldab Ldob*," *Central Asiatic Journal* 9, no. 2 (1964): 125–41.

Page 65. **"There is nothing one cannot buy"**: Heinrich Harrer's description of Lhasa shopping is from Harrer, *Seven Years in Tibet*, 126. The hand grenades are described in Kimura and Berry, *A Japanese Agent in Tibet*, 119. Tashi Tsering's descriptions of the city streets as he saw them on his return to Lhasa after years in the United States are in *The Struggle for Modern Tibet*, 108.

Alexandra David-Néel, when she finally reached Lhasa in 1923, complained volubly about the lack of shops where she could buy antiques. But she confirmed that international trade was quite active: "Nowadays the most conspicuous articles in the Lhasa market are aluminum wares. For the rest, the display is exclusively composed of inferior goods exported from India, England, Japan, or a few other European countries. I have never seen elsewhere uglier cotton cloth, more hideous crockery than that which one finds on the stalls of the Lhasa merchants" (*My Journey* 267).

Page 66. **"This city of gigantic palace and golden roof"**: Perceval Landon's description of the marshes around Lhasa is given in *LHASA*, 11:182.

Page 66. **A circle of some twenty-two *lingkas* or parks**: *Zasak* J. Taring's *Map of Lhasa* was drawn from memory after he went into exile and published by the University of Tokyo Press in 1984.

5. MONUMENTAL STATEMENTS AND STREET PLANS

Page 71. **Forty-three capital construction projects in Tibet**: The 1984 decision to invest in grand construction in Tibet was announced at a party meeting in Beijing, the "Second National Work Forum on Tibet." Details of the forum are given in Tsering Shakya, *The Dragon in the Land of Snows*, 394–98; Tseten Wangchuk Sharlho, "China's Reforms"; and Warren Smith, *Tibetan Nation*, 586–95.

Page 72. **A wave of destruction would recommence**: The most informed discussions of the state of architectural preservation in Lhasa in the 1990s can be found in the publications or Web sites of the Tibet Heritage Fund. These include

descriptions of a few renovation projects that were allowed. The main publication is André Alexander, John Harrison, and Pimpim de Azevedo, eds., *A Clear Lamp Illuminating the Significance and Origin of Historic Buildings and Monuments in Lhasa Barkor Street (Lhasa Old City, Vol. II)* (Berlin: Tibet Heritage Fund, 1999). Another important text is their 1998 report, published as André Alexander and Pimpim de Azevedo, *The Old City of Lhasa—Report from a Conservation Project (98–99)* (Berlin and Kathmandu: Tibet Heritage Fund, 1998), also available at www.asianart.com/lhasa_restoration/report98/index.htm. Other materials, including year-by-year maps of demolitions in the Old City, can be seen at www.tibetheritagefund.org; these show an annual loss of 35 historic buildings in the Old City area, except for the years 1999 and 2000, when losses were lighter. A book by André Alexander, *The Temples of Lhasa: Tibetan Buddhist Architecture from the Seventh to the Twenty-first Centuries* (London: Serindia), is forthcoming.

Page 72. **The final enclosure of what had been the original city**: Details of the history of urban development in Lhasa during the 1980s can be found in Barnett, "Odour of Development," in Pommaret, ed., *Lhasa in the Seventeenth Century*. The stages of urban development in Lhasa are demonstrated most clearly in the three-part map of Lhasa entitled *Tibetan Old Buildings and Urban Development in Lhasa: 1948–1985–1998* (Berlin: VFKA, 1998), produced by the Lhasa Archive Project, part of the Tibet Heritage Fund. These maps are also shown at www.asianart.com/lhasa_restoration/map.html#2. Satellite photographs of these periods and other material concerning Lhasa architecture and the changes it underwent in the 1980s and 1990s can be found in Knud Larsen and Amund Sining-Larsen, *The Lhasa Atlas: Traditional Tibetan Architecture and Townscape* (London: Serindia, 2001).

A detailed survey of old buildings and demolition projects in the city in 1993 can be found in *TIN Background Briefing Paper 23: Demolition and Reconstruction in the Old Quarter of Lhasa 1993* (London: Tibet Information Network, November 1994).

Page 72. **The Tromsikhang**: The name Tromsikhang means "the building from which the market can be seen," and there had for centuries been a marketplace north of the mansion in which the two *amban*s were murdered in the eighteenth century. The Mongol overlord Lhazang Khan and the *amban*s had chosen this mansion for the Chinese Resident, perhaps because they felt the market was the place that, as would-be rulers, they should watch.

Page 74. **The new state appropriated the houses of those who had fled**: The appropriation of rebel properties after the 1959 uprising is described by Ma Rong: "In the late 1950s, the masters and monks of these monasteries fled to India, and the houses and the land were then used for public affairs and government institutions. Some houses belonging to nobles who had fled were distributed among the homeless urban Tibetans. Many new units have been established in the zone around the urban district and gradually expanded into suburbs along the newly constructed roads" ("Patterns" 833). In the 1990s, some

of the mansions confiscated in 1959 were given back to the original owners if they returned to Tibet.

Page 74. **Not so many outward signs of the new regime**: During the new construction initiated by the Chinese authorities, a very considerable portion of the old city was destroyed. This was at the edges, and the new rulers thus left the city's historic center more or less intact. Han Suyin, on her visit in 1975, found that the Lhasa buildings "had not changed their architecture" (she describes their interiors as "sombre" and the courtyards formerly as "toilets") but she acknowledges seeing some demolitions of old buildings: "Today, new Lhasa is growing and the old city is diminishing in size. I saw a bulldozer destroying some houses which will be rebuilt with modern conveniences." She adds in a footnote: "These will have latrines and a modern system of purified running water. One can, if clinging to the exotic, regret that the new houses will probably be in the functional Chinese architecture. However, beautiful old houses belonging to the Tibetan nobility are being kept clean and repaired" (*Lhasa, the Open City*, 38, 176*n*10).

Page 74. **Satellite conurbations**: The satellite mode of urban expansion before the 1980s—the building of small, noncontiguous developments some distance from the city—had begun twenty years before: "Two industrial districts have taken shape on the northern and western outskirts of the city. Factory buildings and workers' houses now stand on what used to be marshy lands. The famous Potala Hill, covered by the Potala Palace, is now surrounded by new buildings for broadcasting, school, bank office, bookshops and the office of the PCART," reported Xinhua (New China News, the official Chinese news agency) in "Lhasa's New Skyline," January 29, 1964 (in *Tibet 1950–1967* [Hong Kong: Union Research Institute, 1968], 596).

Page 75. **"Three groups live in separate zones"**: The three groups identified by Ma Rong in "Patterns" are "native" Lhasa Tibetans, Chinese or Han migrants, and new Tibetan migrants from other areas of the Tibetan plateau (823). Of the first category, "native" Tibetans, he found that 60 percent (27,500) still lived in the old town and 20 percent (c. 9,900) had moved to work units outside the old town. One quarter (8,000) had moved to the outlying area that Ma calls the "suburbs." The Han group was already larger than the Tibetan group remaining in the old town—37,800, mostly living in the work units. Ma found about 23,300 "migrant" Tibetans, whom he says lived in the work units, which had been constructed in the "middle zone." He says that, largely because of the convenience of stationing Chinese migrants in new buildings outside the traditional area and because the government had failed to spend money on construction in the old town, the government had produced "ethnic residential segregation," and that this consequence "should not be forgotten" by planners (835).

Page 76. **"The urban form of straight lines and rectangular squares"**: This quotation is taken from P. Reed, "Form and Context: A Study of Georgian Edinburgh," in T. A. Markus, ed., *Order in Space and Society: Architectural Form and its Context in the Scottish Enlightenment* (Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing,

1982), cited in John Rennie Short, *The Urban Order—An Introduction to Cities, Culture and Power* (Cambridge, MA: Blackwell, 1996), 399.

Page 77. **"Lhasa must therefore be built up"**: The description of the "modern socialist city" is given in "Preface to the Maps" in the *Lhasa Municipal Planning Maps*. This volume was published in book form, in Chinese, by the Tibet Autonomous Region Planning Department. It contains outline maps showing the official city plan for Lhasa from 1980 until 2000. No date of publication is given, but it was probably produced in 1981 or shortly afterward. The actual 1980 plans, in text form, have not been published, but fragments of the internal documents that together make up the full text have emerged. One is "Summary of Present Construction Situation" in *Lhasa City Planning Documents* (provisional title), part 9, Lhasa (1980). This is held in the Tibet Information Network archive (London) as TIN Doc. 13 (WZ).

Page 77. **One of the last *amban*s had given 1,000 *taels***: Zhang Yintang, during the seven months from 1904–5 that he served as *amban*, organized a scheme to plant trees around Lhasa and to have public parks set up, according to Ma Lihua, *Old Lhasa,* 143. Ma claims that the effort failed mainly because of corruption (on the Tibetan side) and lack of planning.

Page 78. **"A decade had passed since I left Lhasa"**: The description by Tashi Tsering of the tree-lined streets is from his autobiography, *The Struggle for Modern Tibet*, 108.

Page 78. **The British residency at Dekyi Lingka**: A description of Dekyi Lingka, and of many aspects of pre–1950 Lhasa life, is provided by Tsering Shakya in "Cities and Thrones and Powers: The British and the Tibetans in Lhasa, 1936–1947," in Harris and Shakya, eds., *Seeing Lhasa,* 79–125. Shakya, a leading modern Tibetan historian, lived in Dekyi Lingka as a child and describes his recollections of its gardens on 124.

Page 78. **Geraniums to Tibet**: Richardson was not the only diplomat in Lhasa to have made an impact on the city's horticulture, if Ma Lihua is correct. According to her, Zhang Yintang "is commemorated in the name of a popular flower in Tibet, the 'Lord Zhang Flower' which can often be seen in residential courtyards and public places in Lhasa. That plant grows chest-high, and has eight petals either red or white. If you look closely, these can be further divided into pink and purple…in Lhasa, there is a Lord Zhang vegetable garden and a Lord Zhang tree" (*Old Lhasa* 135–36). The flower is usually known as coreopsis.

Page 81. **A vast military parade ground**: *China Daily,* the official English-language paper in Beijing, announced the existence of a plan to construct the "new Potala Palace Square" on the site of the village of Shöl (*China Daily,* March 24, 1994). Most of the Tibetan residents had already been evicted from the village by the time the article was published. Construction of the Potala Palace Square began in Lhasa on October 18, 1994, according to Xinhua (*BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*, October 23, 1994): "It will be 600 by 400 m. in area and is expected to cost 110 mln. yuan [c. $13 mln]."

Page 81. **He climbed the flagpole at its center**: For details of the flagpole incident in August 1999, see "Tashi Tsering Hospitalised with Severe Head Injury and a Broken Arm," Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala, India, October 8, 1999; Kate Saunders, "Concern for Imprisoned Female Head-Teacher of Children," December 22, 2003, published online in *World Tibet News,* December 23, 2003, part 2; "Death Sentence for Bangri Rinpoche Commuted to Life Imprisonment," Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, Dharamsala, December 16, 2004; and *The Tragic Fate of Bangri Rinpoche* (Dharamsala: The Gu Chu Sum Movement of Tibet, 2005).

6. FROM CONCRETE TO BLUE GLASS

Page 85. **Washington's threat to impose trade restrictions on China**: The renewal of China's trading privileges with the United States, known as "most-favored-nation status," in April–May 1994 signaled the end of U.S. efforts to use forceful diplomacy to get China to improve its human rights practices. The previous year, the White House had declared publicly that the privileges would not be continued unless ten changes concerning human rights were implemented, but in due course found itself obliged to renew them with nothing conceded by Beijing. I have written about this period and its consequences for Tibet policy in Robert Barnett and Mickey Spiegel, *Cutting Off the Serpent's Head: Tightening Control in Tibet 1994–95* (London: Tibet Information Network and New York: Human Rights Watch, 1996).

Page 85. **Cement…and the factories that produced it**: "Construction of the Lhasa Cement Plant started in 1960. Completed in 1963, it has already supplied over 10,000 tons of cement for Tibetan construction projects [and] has an annual capacity of 32,000 tons. Nearly all the 200 Tibetan workers trained at the plant were slaves or serfs in the past" ("Tibet Produces Its Own Cement," Xinhua, November 11, 1964, reproduced in the compendium *Tibet 1950–1967* [Hong Kong: Union Research Institute, 1968], 577). In 1980 the Lhasa Cement Factory had 700 workers, and the Prefabrication Factory, built in 1977 to produce cement blocks, had 220 workers, making these probably the most significant factories in Lhasa. At that time one fifth of the workforce was in construction (8,000 people), not including road workers. See "Summary of Present Construction Situation" in *Lhasa City Planning Documents* (1980), 2. As of 2004, the cement factory below Sera monastery and the garbage dump between them were due to be moved to the outskirts of the city. The other major cement factories that had been located beyond the northeastern border of the city had been surrounded by the leading edge of suburban expansion.

Page 86. **The dust from the smokestacks**: The issue of environmental pollution had already been noticed with some concern by local residents. In October 1998, students at the Lhasa Teacher Training School reportedly circulated a petition saying, "Air pollution, deforestation, degradation of grasslands, des-

ertification, acid rain and other environmental perils devastate the environment of Tibet, which directly influences our livelihood.... If we look at the future of industry in Lhasa, there are problems all around: polluted rivers and streams flow in the north of the city, thick clouds of smoke emit in the west, and there is the constant music blaring in the centre of the city. Everybody has seen these problems, but nobody even attempts to solve them. Is this modern civilisation? As human civilisation develops, is it not the human greed for wealth that may ultimately lead to the demise of this civilisation?" The petition was published in translation in "Police Banned Lhasa Students' Procession and Petition for Cleaner Tibetan Environment" (Dharamsala: Department of Information and International Affairs, Tibetan government in exile, January 8, 1999).

Page 86. **Tibetan forests then being cleared**: The timber trade in Tibet and other areas of western China was effectively unregulated until 1998, when the authorities banned logging in areas surrounding the upper reaches of China's major rivers. This followed flooding that led to more than 3,000 deaths in lower China earlier that year. See "The Decision of the CCP Central Committee on Several Major Issues Concerning Agriculture and Rural Work—Adopted by the Third Plenary Session of the 15th CCP Central Committee on 14th October 1998," Xinhua, October 20, 1998, and John Pomfret, "Yangtze Flood Jolts China's Land Policies; Development Curbs Set to Protect Environment," *Washington Post*, November 22, 1998.

Page 86. **The only significant industrial product in Tibet**: The effort to industrialize Tibet was a centerpiece of China's policy in the 1960s and 1970s, and was widely presented in its public relations materials. But besides cement production, it chiefly consisted of a matchstick factory in Kongpo and a wool and textile operation in Nyingtri, 300 miles east of Lhasa. All the components of the textile factory had had to be trucked into Tibet from Shanghai piece by piece, including the workers. A description of the factory is given by Han Suyin in *Lhasa, the Open City*, 124–25.

Page 86. **Tibet's major form of heavy industry**: Economic policy in the TAR by the end of the century was to prioritize the development of "five pillar industries." These were mining, forestry, agricultural and livestock by-products and handicrafts, tourism, and construction. By 2003, after Beijing had imposed a ban on logging in the region, the list had been changed to "six pillar industries," in which forestry was replaced by Tibetan medicine and organic products. The focus of industrialization in Tibet remained on mining, and in 1994 there were 145 mining enterprises in the region, though they were reported to employ only 5,000 people. That year the TAR produced 115,000 tons of chromite, 23,200 tons of borax, 10,300 tons of mineral water, 27,000 tons of lead and zinc, 20.88 kilograms of gold sand, 5,800 tons of coal, and 310,000 tons of limestone. An official of the Tibet Mining Bureau claimed that 94 kinds of minerals had been discovered in 1,719 locations in the TAR,

with 39 boasting "impressive reserves." See, for example, *China's Tibet* 6, no. 5 (Winter 1995) and Jane Caple, *Mining Tibet* (London: Tibet Information Network, 2002).

Page 87. **The Spring Tide**: The "Spring Tide" form of economic development was promoted and implemented in the Tibet Autonomous Region by a new party secretary, Chen Kuiyuan, who had been brought from his previous position in Inner Mongolia in March 1992, initially as a deputy secretary. The campaign to spread the rapid marketization approach across China began that month, and Chen's transfer may have been connected to it. He emerged as a forceful exponent of that philosophy, and seems to have seen it as an economic method to contain and suppress forms of Tibetan culture and belief that he considered threatening, as well as to legitimize an increase in non-Tibetan migration to the region's urban areas. An account of this policy shift is given in Barnett and Spiegel, *Cutting Off the Serpent's Head,* and in Robert Barnett, "The Chinese Frontiersman and the Winter Worms—The Traditions of Chen Kuiyuan in the TAR, 1992–2000," in Alex McKay, ed., *Tibet and Her Neighbours* (London: Curzon, 2003), 207–39.

Page 87. **"Individually run enterprises"**: The surge in individual enterprises was announced in "Roundup on Tibet's Private Sector Economy" in *Xizang Ribao (Tibet Daily),* February 4, 1994, and published in translation by *BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*, March 2, 1994. The business sector in Lhasa has been studied by Hu Xiaojiang in *Little Shops of Lhasa: Migrant Businesses and the Making of a Market in a Transitional Economy* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, forthcoming).

Page 90. **Bars, nightclubs, and 24-hour hair salons**: The dramatic increase in prostitution and gambling establishments was discussed by party leaders in the press, and some attempts were made to regulate the leisure industry. In January 1997, Deputy Party Secretary Tenzin was reported as saying that the focus of the party's work in this respect was "to wipe out pornography, gambling, drug addiction, and other vicious social phenomena [and it] is to inspect ballrooms, karaoke shops, bars, and restaurants; put an end to the providing of women for drinking, dancing, and other activities to customers and prostitution; ban gambling." See "Danzim Listens to Report on Work to Crack Down on Pornographic and Illegal Publications, Calls for Grasping Key Points and Concentrating Efforts on Purifying Society," *Xizang Ribao (Tibet Daily),* January 23, 1997, 1 (published in translation as "Tibet Cracks Down on Illegal, Pornographic Publications" by the *BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*). Many Tibetans in Lhasa believe that any attempts to regulate or decrease these industries have been purely token.

Page 90. **"On a recent stroll through the streets of Lhasa"**: The letter to "Comrade Editor" is from "Unhealthy Shop Signs in Lhasa Should Be Cleaned Up," *Xizang Ribao (Tibet Daily),* August 23, 1996, 4. This translation is by Tibet Information Network.

Page 91. **20 square miles**: The figures for the size of the city in 1997—52 square kilometers—are from "Lhasa Makes Great Achievements," *China Daily*, August 19, 1997.

Page 92. **Access to tap water**: A survey of water provision in the Barkor in 1993 can be found in *TIN Background Briefing Paper 23* (London: Tibet Information Network, 1994). The figures for tap water supply in 1997 are from "Lhasa Makes Great Achievements," *China Daily*, August 19, 1997.

Page 92. **City toilets:** Han Suyin discusses toilet practices and the lack of toilet paper in the mid-1970s in her book *Lhasa, the Open City*, where she claims that Tibetans still were defecating in the street as late as 1962, thirteen years before her visit. There was "no domestic drainage system and no arrangement for the disposal of sewage...in 1975 this was changed, with the institution of inconspicuous public latrines and the system of removal" (38). The history of foreign contempt toward Tibetan hygiene and the failure of city planners and developers in the 1980s and 1990s to provide toilets is discussed in Barnett, "Odour of Development," in Pommaret, ed., *Lhasa in the Seventeenth Century*, 218–19. By 2005 the white and orange toilets had been replaced by more attractive buildings in Tibetan style.

7. THE NEW FLAMBOYANCE AND THE TIBETAN PALM TREE

Page 97. **The importation of steel girders**: The development of new Tibetan construction methods in the early twentieth century is discussed in Harris and Shakya, eds., *Seeing Lhasa*. The home that the Ngapö family built in the 1950s still stands between the southeast corner of the campus of Tibet University and the north bank of the Kyichu river.

Page 98. **Wages of all government employees**: The level of salaries in the TAR is discussed in "High TAR Wages Benefit the Privileged," Tibet Information Network, February 10, 2005. The average annual salary in the TAR was 26,931 *yuan* in 2003, close to twice the national average in China that year. This partly reflects higher costs in Lhasa because of the expense of transporting consumer goods and fuel by truck, and also could include "hardship bonuses" and "remoteness allowances" given to all government employees in Tibet. Even so, it represents a major increase in wealth for the Tibetan cadre class.

Page 98. **Cadre class**: The term "cadre"—*ganbu* in Chinese or *las byed pa* in Tibetan—means in the Chinese context any person employed by the government, including schoolteachers, policemen, kitchen staff in work units, and other state employees. They need not necessarily be an administrative official or a member of the Communist Party, though often a cadre might be both.

Page 98. **A private property market**: The reforms that led to the setting up of a housing market in Tibet are discussed in "Housing Reform: Key Policy is to Sell Off State Housing Units," Tibet TV, March 16, 1994, published in translation by the *BBC Summary of World Broadcasts*.

Page 99. **Domestic servants**: The return of domestic labor to Lhasa households and some of its consequences have been examined in a short story, "The Yellow Leaves of Summer," by the leading modern Tibetan writer, Tashi Palden; the plot concerns a disastrous love affair between the husband of a family and the country girl who works for them. For an English version, see Riika J. Virtanen (compiler and translator), *A Blighted Flower and Other Stories: Portraits of Women in Modern Tibetan Literature* (New Delhi: Paljor Publications, 2000), 105–28.

Page 102. **"A song and dance performance"**: The celebrations that were held to celebrate the visit of Hu Jintao, then the vice president of China, to Lhasa in 2001 are described in "Fireworks Show Marks Tibet's Peaceful Liberation Anniversary," Xinhua, July 19, 2001. Entrance to the Potala Square was strictly controlled before and during the main parade, with the deployment of extensive military resources for security. Only designated delegates from work units or schools could enter the square at that time, so most people would only have seen the parade on television.

Page 102. **The first multistory block**: Other skyscrapers were constructed in Lhasa during the 1990s, including a sixteen-story trade center south of the Drepung cement factory, but these were several miles west of the traditional city. The new Lhasa City Public Security Bureau headquarters was the first such block erected close to the historic section of Lhasa.

Page 102. **Dorje Yuthok's family name**: The name Yuthok may have been given to the family because their house was near the covered bridge with the turquoise-colored roof tiles. This family was ennobled in the early nineteenth century because one of their children had been recognized as the tenth Dalai Lama. They then moved to a house near the bridge. Alexandra David-Néel, however, gave a different account of the family's name, writing in 1923 that the family received the title because of the award of a "turquoise knob" from a Chinese emperor (*My Journey* 272).

Page 103. **Lhasa's first official "market street"**: The 1960s development of Yuthok street into a market area was described by Luoga (Loga), then the Mayor of Lhasa, in a magazine article by Liu Tungfen and Wangdu, "How Are You Improving the Living Standard of the People of Lhasa?—Interview with Loga, Mayor of Lhasa Municipality," published in *Grung-go bod ljongs* (the Tibetan-language edition of *China's Tibet*) (Spring 1991):7–16.

Page 104. **An apology**: A disclaimer for earlier pro-Tibetan activism was written by Patrick French in *Tibet, Tibet: A Personal History of a Lost Land* (London: HarperCollins, 2003); French, a former director of a prominent pro-Tibet lobby organization in the United Kingdom, came to believe that outside activism had worsened the situation and that change could only come from inside. Some fundamental claims made by outside commentators, such as the use of the term "colonial" to describe conditions in Tibet and Xinjiang, are attacked in Barry Sautman, "Is Tibet China's Colony?: The Claim of Demographic Catastrophe,"

Journal of Asian Law 15, no. 1 (Fall 2001): 81ff.; and Barry Sautman, "Is Xinjiang an Internal Colony?", *Inner Asia* 2 (2000): 239–71. Sautman also wrote a lengthy critique of the Dalai Lama's credibility, "Association, Federation and 'Genuine' Autonomy: The Dalai Lama's Proposals and Tibet Independence," paper presented at the Association of Asian Studies Annual Meeting, San Diego, California, March 9–12, 2000.

Page 105. **Chinese writers and artists**: The most prominent writings in Chinese about Tibet to have appeared in the 1990s were short stories or novels by Ma Yuan, Ma Jian, Alai, and Tashi Dawa. These authors all wrote in Chinese and in a style they developed from the magical realism of Jorge Luis Borges and Gabriel García Márquez. Ma Yuan worked as a journalist in Tibet from 1982 to 1987 and published a number of short stories with Tibetan themes that became major examples of avant-garde writing in China; three are published in translation in Batt, ed., *Tales of Tibet*, 5–76. Ma Jian was notorious for "Stick Out the Fur on Your Tongue or It's All a Void," a fantasy about Tibet that had to be withdrawn in 1987 because of its salacious accounts of imaginary Tibetan sexuality, which Tibetans complained were insulting. Extracts from the story, together with an important critique by the editors, were published in English in Geremie Barmé and John Minford, eds., *Seeds of Fire: Chinese Voices of Conscience* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1988), 432–52; the title of Ma Jian's piece is given in that volume as "Show Me the Colour of Your Tongue or Fuck All." A longer extract is published in Batt, ed., *Tales of Tibet*, 235–54. Ma Jian's account of traveling in western China is published in English as *Red Dust: A Path Through China* (New York: Anchor Books, 2001).

Tashi Dawa, who is half Tibetan, became famous for his magical realist style in novels such as *A Soul in Bondage* (English translation, Beijing: Chinese Literature Press, 1992) and *The Tumultuous Shambhala* (Beijing: Writers Publishing House, 1993) and short stories such as "The Glory of the Wind Horse," published in translation in *Manoa* 12, no. 2 (2000): 96–113. Alai is a Tibetan writer from Gyalrong in the southeastern Amdo borderlands, now part of Ngaba prefecture in Sichuan, whose novel *Chen ai lou ding* (*When the Dust Settles*), translated by Howard Goldblatt and Sylvia Li-chun Lin as *Red Poppies* (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2002), won China's main literary prize in 2000 and was turned into a popular television drama series.

Nonfiction in Chinese about Tibet has been dominated by Ma Lihua, who wrote several works of popular ethnography or travel writing, one of which was translated into English by an official publisher as *Glimpses of Northern Tibet* (Beijing: Panda Books, 1991). She also produced a series of television documentaries about Tibet. Not all of the works in Chinese at this time were romantic reveries; the most influential study of Tibet in Chinese has been Wang Lixiong's *Tian Zang* (*Sky Burial*, 1997), the first of many important essays he was to produce on the Tibetan question, among which was the pamphlet "Dalai Lama Is the Key for the Solution for the Issue of Tibet" (May to July 2000).

The most incisive of all PRC-published works in Chinese or Tibetan on contemporary Tibetan culture and politics is Derong Tsering Dondrup's *Wode Xinyuan* (Tibetan: *Bdag gi re smon*; Ganzi [also written as Kandze or Kartse]: Ganzi baoshe yinshuachang [Ganzi Newspaper Office Printing Press], undated, probably November 1995). However, this was issued only as an internal document and never widely circulated in China.

One of the most significant books in Chinese on Tibet is *Xizang Biji* (*Tibet Notes* [Guangzhou: Huacheng Publishing House, 2003]) by the Tibetan writer Oeser (her name can also be transcribed as Woeser; it is written as Weise in Chinese). The book was banned in late 2003. Her earlier poems in Chinese (Weise, *Xizang zai shang* [*For Tibet*] [Xining: Qinghai People's Publishing House, 1999]) have been described by some Chinese as influential in shaping opinions about Tibet. Oeser was born in 1966 in Lhasa but was brought up in the Kham region of Tibet, part of Sichuan province. She graduated in 1988 from the South-West Nationalities Institute in Chengdu and worked in Lhasa from 1989 (see "TAR Authorities Ban Book by Tibetan Author," *TIN News Update*, Tibet Information Network, March 16, 2004 and "Tibetan Stories: Extracts from 'Notes on Tibet'," *TIN Special Report*, Tibet Information Network, May 4, 2004).

Both Oeser and Wang Lixiong published major pieces of highly critical writing on the Internet in 2004 and 2005, including Wang's essay "Tibet Facing Imperialism of Two Kinds: An Analysis of the Woeser Incident—Cultural Suppression from Political Imperialism" (posted on www.asiademo.org, with translation issued online through World Tibet News on December 21, 2004); Oeser's essay "Remembering March 10th: Let's Insist on Our Culture" (posted on www.tibetcult.org, March 10, 2005); and Oeser's poem "Secret Tibet: Dedicated to the Imprisoned Tenzin Delek Rinpoche, Bangri Rinpoche and Lobsang Tenzin" (posted on New Century Net at www.ncn.org, second draft, November 10, 2004).

Page 105. **A movement widespread in republican China**: The emergence of widespread interest in Tibetan Buddhism among Chinese in the 1930s has been documented in Gray Tuttle, *Tibetan Buddhists in the Making of Modern China*. Public ceremonies were celebrated in the 1930s by the Panchen Lama and other Buddhist teachers in Beijing and Shanghai, sometimes with audiences of up to 75,000 people.

Page 114. ***Geshe* Lamrim**: On the death of *Geshe* Lamrim, see "Leading Religious Teacher Dies," Tibet Information Network, June 14, 1997.