

Keeping the Edge

Keeping the Edge

Managing Defense for the Future

EDITED BY ASHTON B. CARTER & JOHN P. WHITE

A Publication of the
PREVENTIVE DEFENSE PROJECT
*A research collaboration
of the
Kennedy School of Government
Harvard University
and
Stanford University*

ASHTON B. CARTER AND WILLIAM J. PERRY, CO-DIRECTORS
*Cambridge, Massachusetts
Stanford, California*
2000

WITH CONTRIBUTIONS BY

Denis A. Bovin
Ashton B. Carter
David S.C. Chu
Victor A. DeMarines
John M. Deutch
Jane Harman
Robert J. Hermann
Arnold Kanter
Michael J. Lippitz

Judith A. Miller
Sean O'Keefe
William J. Perry
Brent Scowcroft
John M. Shalikashvili
Elizabeth Sherwood-Randall
John M. Stewart
John P. White
Herbert S. Winokur, Jr.

© 2000 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College and the Board of Trustees of Leland Stanford Junior University

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means (including information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

ISBN 0-9705414-0-6

The Preventive Defense Project

<www.preventivedefenseproject.org>

Harvard University

Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs

Kennedy School of Government

79 John F. Kennedy Street

Cambridge MA 02138

Preventive Defense Project Coordinator

(617) 495-1405

Stanford University

Center for International Security and Cooperation

Encina Hall

Stanford CA 94305-6165

(650) 725-6501

From January 2001, this book will be available from The MIT Press,
Cambridge, Massachusetts

September 2000

Edited and designed by Teresa Lawson Editorial Consulting

<tjlawson@ultranet.com>

Cover designed by Graciela Galup

<ggalup@mediaone.net>

Printed by Puritan Press

<www.puritanpress.com>

*This book is dedicated to David Packard,
whose vision of quality management in
defense it seeks to continue*

Contents

About the Preventive Defense Project	viii
Preface and Acknowledgments	ix
1 Keeping the Edge: Managing Defense for the Future <i>Ashton B. Carter</i>	1
2 Keeping the Edge in Joint Operations <i>John M. Shalikashvili with Bruce Rember, Phil Ehr, & Thomas Longstreth</i>	27
3 Exploiting the Internet Revolution <i>Victor A. DeMarines with David Lehman & John Quilty</i>	61
4 Keeping the Edge in Intelligence <i>Robert J. Hermann</i>	103
5 Countering Asymmetric Threats <i>Ashton B. Carter & William J. Perry with David Aidekman</i>	119
6 Keeping the Technological Edge <i>Ashton B. Carter with Marcel Lettre & Shane Smith</i>	129
7 Advancing the Revolution in Business Affairs <i>Michael J. Lippitz, Sean O'Keefe, & John P. White with John Brown</i>	165
8 Ensuring Quality People in Defense <i>David S.C. Chu & John P. White with Nurith Bernstein & John Brown</i>	203
9 Managing the Pentagon's International Relations <i>Elizabeth Sherwood-Randall with Christiana Briggs & Anja Miller</i>	235
10 Strengthening the National Security Interagency Process <i>John Deutch, Arnold Kanter, & Brent Scowcroft with Christopher Hornbarger</i>	265
11 Implementing Change <i>Judith A. Miller</i>	285
About the Core Group and the Authors	303
Other Publications of the Preventive Defense Project	316

About the Preventive Defense Project

ASHTON B. CARTER & WILLIAM J. PERRY, CO-DIRECTORS

The Preventive Defense Project is a joint venture between the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University and Stanford University, co-directed by Ashton B. Carter and William J. Perry. Preventive Defense is a concept for American defense strategy in the post-Cold War era, premised on the belief that the absence of an imminent, major, traditional military threat to American security presents today's leaders with an unaccustomed challenge and opportunity to prevent future Cold War-scale threats to international security from emerging. While the U.S. defense establishment must continue to deter major regional conflicts and provide peacekeeping and humanitarian relief missions when necessary, its highest priority is to contribute to forestalling developments that could directly threaten the survival and vital interests of American citizens.

To this end, the Project focuses on forging productive security partnerships with Russia and its neighbors, engaging an emerging China, addressing the lethal legacy of Cold War weapons of mass destruction (WMD), and countering WMD proliferation and potential acts of catastrophic terrorism. In doing so, PDP seeks to devise creative, new policy approaches that reflect a preventive defense posture and, through intense personal interaction with political and military leaders around the world, nourish a highly informed but non-governmental "track-two" dialogue that explores opportunities for international agreement and cooperation. In addition, PDP has undertaken an intense review of the U.S. government's structures and practices for carrying out foreign and security policies, which have not changed in half a century.

Preface and Acknowledgments

In its three years of existence, the Preventive Defense Project, a research collaboration of Stanford University and the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, co-directed by William J. Perry and Ashton B. Carter, has worked to devise and promote policies to advance U.S. national security and international security. The Project's efforts have extended from Russia to China, and from counterproliferation to counter-terrorism. In all our work, we have sought to prescribe specific policies and actions the U.S. government can adopt to prevent new security threats from emerging in the post-Cold War world.

Like most other policy thinkers, we have tended to assume that once Washington got the policy right, implementation of those policies would follow smoothly. This assumption, however, has increasingly seemed to us unwarranted. While the U.S. military capability for joint operations is unquestionably the best in the world, the "back room" of the Department of Defense (DOD) — contracting, personnel policies, and managerial practices — is not up to the standards found elsewhere in our society, nor is it up to the level that the taxpayers have a right to expect of their government. While the United States has defined the key defense missions of the post-Cold War world, the structure and practices of DOD have adapted only incompletely to the job of accomplishing them. In the short run, the potential benefits of wise strategy and policy will not be fully realized, but it is in the long run that shortcomings in management and organization will really come to haunt us, diminishing our presently unmatched military capability.

With this book, the Preventive Defense Project seeks to prescribe remedies for some of the organizational and managerial deficiencies of the national security establishment. Our focus is largely on DOD and the interagency process of policy and program coordination. We believe these problems and proposed solutions warrant high-priority attention from the next U.S. presidential administration and Congress. Both executive and legislative branches will have new beginnings in January 2001, and there is no better time to tackle problems of the underlying functioning of the government. Man-

agement and organization problems are not the juiciest of issues for campaigns and high politics, to be sure. However, when newly elected and appointed officials take office, they will find that their ability to translate their policies into results will depend crucially on making the kinds of adaptations described in this volume.

Not all of these issues are new: problems of defense management, particularly reform of DOD's cumbersome acquisition system, were of deep concern to the late David Packard, Deputy Secretary of Defense and co-founder of the Hewlett-Packard Company. As deputy secretary and later as Chairman of President Reagan's Blue Ribbon Commission on Defense Management — which became known as the Packard Commission — David Packard pioneered many of the themes that animate this book. Preventive Defense Project co-director William J. Perry served on the Packard Commission; as Secretary of Defense two decades later he promoted Packard's vision of quality management in government. Our work here is in many ways an attempt to fulfill this vision. We were therefore particularly gratified to receive early support for the preparation of this book from the David and Lucile Packard Foundation; we thank President Richard T. Schlosberg III and Cole Wilbur of the Foundation for giving us this opportunity. In token of our respect and gratitude, we have dedicated this book to the memory of David Packard.

The Project also received critical and generous support from The Simons Foundation, the Herbert S. Winokur, Jr. Public Policy Fund, and the MITRE Corporation. The Preventive Defense Project as a whole was launched and has been nurtured by the Carnegie Corporation of New York and The John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation. The founders and staff of these supporting organizations not only provided resources vital to the completion of this book, but were collaborators in conceiving and shaping the ideas that appear in these pages. The Project also received key inputs and inspiration from David Baxt, Vance Coffman, Stephen Hadley, John Hamre, and Philip A. Odeen.

It is in the long run — on the watch of the next generation of defense policy leaders — that uncorrected management problems will really make themselves felt if steps to solve them are not taken now. For this reason, we acknowledge our responsibility and our privilege in teaching and collaborating with some of these future leaders at Harvard and Stanford. It seemed appropriate that these students and

fellows at our universities be included in this Project, where they provided much of the necessary research, ideas, and constant prodding. They are listed on the bylines of chapters to which they made special contributions, and we wish also to thank them here: David Aidekman, Christiana Briggs, John Brown, Phil Ehr, Christopher Hornbarger, Marcel Lettre, Anja Miller, and Bruce Rember. We also thank those other collaborators who contributed in so many ways to the range and depth of our work, including Nurith Berstein at RAND, Thomas Longstreth at the Department of Defense, David Lehman and John Quilty at MITRE, and Shane Smith at Harvard.

Special thanks are due to consulting editor and publication manager Teresa J. Lawson, whose ability to elicit silk purse prose from sows' ears drafts is as remarkable as it was needed. The Preventive Defense Project Coordinator at Harvard, Shane Smith, kept the Core Group members focused and organized, in addition to making his own research contributions to the book. Gretchen Bartlett and Lillian Politser at Harvard and Deborah Gordon at Stanford somehow found time among all their other university and Preventive Defense Project responsibilities to administer this project with their typical perfection. We are deeply grateful to all.

Denis A. Bovin

Ashton B. Carter

David S.C. Chu

Victor A. DeMarines

John M. Deutch

Jane Harman

Robert J. Hermann

Arnold Kanter

Michael J. Lippitz

Judith A. Miller

Sean O'Keefe

William J. Perry

Brent Scowcroft

John M. Shalikashvili

Elizabeth Sherwood-Randall

John M. Stewart

John P. White

Herbert S. Winokur, Jr.

Core Group
Defense Organization and Management Project
Preventive Defense Project