Transboundary freshwater dispute resolution

## Water Resources Management and Policy Series Editors

Dr. Juha I. Uitto Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist, Global Environment Facility Washington, DC, USA

Prof. Asit K. Biswas President, Third World Centre for Water Management Mexico City, Mexico

### **International Advisory Board**

Dr. Mahmoud A. Abu-Zeid Minister of Public Works and Water Resources Giza, Egypt

Dr. Benedito P.F. Braga Professor of Civil Engineering, Colorado State University Fort Collins, USA Dr. Ralph Daley Director, UNU/INWEH Hamilton, Ontario, Canada

Dr. David Seckler Director-General, International Water Management Institute Colombo, Sri Lanka

Dr. Ismail Serageldin
Vice President, Special Programs, The
World Bank
Washington, DC, USA

Dr. Aly M. Shady
Canadian International Development
Agency (CIDA)
Hull, Quebec, Canada

Prof. Yutaka Takahasi Professor Emeritus, Tokyo University Tokyo, Japan

Dr. Jose Galicia Tundisi International Institute of Ecology Sao Carlos SP, Brazil

The UNU Programme on Integrated Basin Management focuses on water management, approaching the complex problematique from three particular angles: governance, capacity-building, and management tools. The programme is carried out through field-based research encompassing both natural and social sciences. It utilizes extensive networks of scholars and institutions in both developing and industrialized countries. This work is intended to contribute to policy-making by the United Nations and the international community, as well as to capacity-building in developing countries.

The Water Resources Management and Policy series disseminates the results of research carried out under the Programme on Integrated Basin Management and related activities. The series focuses on policy-relevant topics of wide interest to scholars, practitioners, and policy-makers.

Earlier books in this series are: Hydropolities Along the Jordan River: Scarce Water and its Impact on the Arab-Israeli Conflict by Aaron T. Wolf; Managing Water for Peace in the Middle East: Alternative Strategies by Masahiro Murakami; Freshwater Resources in Arid Lands edited by Juha I. Uitto and Jutta Schneider; Central Eurasian Water Crisis: Caspian, Aral and Dead Seas edited by Iwao Kobori and Michael H. Glantz; Latin American River Basins: Amazon, Plata, and São Francisco edited by Asit K. Biswas, Newton V. Cordiero, Benedito P.F. Braga, and Cecilia Tortajada; Water for Urban Areas: Challenges and Perspectives edited by Juha I. Uitto and Asit K. Biswas.

# Transboundary freshwater dispute resolution: Theory, practice, and annotated references

By Heather L. Beach, Jesse Hammer, J. Joseph Hewitt, Edy Kaufman, Anja Kurki, Joe A. Oppenheimer, and Aaron T. Wolf



#### © The United Nations University, 2000

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United Nations University.

United Nations University Press The United Nations University, 53-70, Jingumae 5-chome, Shibuya-ku, Tokyo, 150-8925, Japan Tel: +81-3-3499-2811 Fax: +81-3-3406-7345 E-mail: sales@hq.unu.edu http://www.unu.edu

United Nations University Office in North America 2 United Nations Plaza, Room DC2-1462-70, New York, NY 10017, USA Tel: +1-212-963-6387 Fax: +1-212-371-9454 E-mail: unuona@igc.apc.org

United Nations University Press is the publishing division of the United Nations University.

Cover design by Joyce C. Weston Cover photograph by Iwao Kobori

Printed in the United States of America

UNUP-1038 ISBN 92-808-1038-3

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Transboundary freshwater dispute resolution: theory, practice, and annotated references / by Heather L. Beach  $\dots$  [et al.].

p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 92-808-1038-3

1. Water-Law and legislation. 2. Transboundary pollution-Law and legislation. 3. Water rights (International law) I. Beach, Heather L. II. Title.

K3496.T73 2000 341.7'6253—dc21

00-008341

# Contents

Pr	eface	viii
Α	cknowledgements	X
Pa	urt 1	1
1	Introduction	3
Pa	art 2: Theory	5
2	Organizational theory Institutions and law Water negotiations and institutional capacity International water law Hydrography vs chronology Summary Negotiation theory. Conflict. Resolution Case studies – illustrations and generalizations. Summary	7 7 7 9 11 13 14 14 17 24 25
3	Economic theory	27

## vi CONTENTS

	Optimization models
	Optimization models and regional planning
	Social planner approach
	Inter and intraregional allocations
	Markets
	Case studies
	Summary
	Game theory
Pa	nrt 3: Practice
4	Water disputes
_	Comparative analysis and case studies
	Anticipating possible water conflict
	Indicators for type and intensity of conflict
	Obstacles to successful negotiations.
	National vs international settings
	Summary
	Water treaties
	Literature review
	Background of modern water treaties
	Methodology
	The database and its contents
	Summary
	•
5	Environmental disputes
	Environmental security
	History
	Defining the concept
	The debate
	Bringing it together
	Water (transboundary resources)
	Summary
	Other resources
	The overarching problem of resource scarcity
	Oil
	Land
	Roads
	Fishing
	Air pollution
	Global warming
	Summary

Part 4			
6	Conclusions and summary	73	
P	art 5: Appendixes	77	
7	Case studies Case studies of transboundary dispute resolution.  Danube river  Euphrates basin  Jordan river watershed.  Ganges river controversy  Indus Water Treaty  Mekong Committee  Nile Waters Agreement.  Plata basin  Salween river  US/Mexico shared aquifers  Aral sea  The International Joint Commission: Canada and the  United States of America  Lesotho Highlands water project.	79 79 84 88 91 96 101 107 111 115 117 119 121	
8	Treaty summaries	132	
9	Annotated literature	221	
10	) Bibliography	268	
T	ables		
1	Selected treaty clauses regarding non-water linkages and unique water sharing	54	
2	Case studies	80	

## Preface

This work attempts to provide a comprehensive review of the relevant literature on managing conflicts stemming from the quantity and quality problems of water around the world. Current trends and projections suggest that disputes based on water scarcity escalate when the issue is not addressed effectively and in a timely manner. Proactive efforts to prevent these conflicts have been overwhelmed by pessimistic forecasting. This situation negatively affects multilateral cooperative efforts and results in attempts to pursue unilateral short-term gains and in some cases increases in military power. So far, few comprehensive and interdisciplinary analyses of such international surface water conflicts have been produced. Only fragmented findings and scattered experimentational endeavours are available to the conflict resolution community.

In this report we introduce knowledge from the fields of transboundary water disputes and conflict resolution. The latter incorporates the studies of political geography, economy, and hydrology. In addition, it draws upon the expertise of specialists in the areas of formal modelling, conflict resolution, and environmental and natural resources. The data in the report include a variety of factual information about individual cases as well as bilateral and multilateral agreements and general principles.

The literature surveyed indicates that while in many areas there has been extensive research and analysis, there continues to be a need for more studies on the specific situations that lead to conflicts over water and other environmental resources. Lateral learning, an attempt to under-

stand the similarities between all conflicts over natural resources, will lend itself to future applications in predicting and preventing these conflicts.

A survey of international watersheds provides some bibliographical and general data collected from over 200 transboundary watersheds. Some countries share one or two river systems while others share quite a few. The India-Bangladesh Joint Rivers Commission counted 140 tributary systems in common. The fortunate corollary is that because water is such a scarce and vital resource, it has sometimes brought hostile co-riparians together into a cooperative mode, often with external incentives. A subset of case studies of the exhaustive list of international watersheds is examined in greater detail. A related effort is a compilation and analysis of relevant water treaties, and the rationale for the partial implementation of these treaties.

# Acknowledgements

This project simply would not have been possible without the initiation and leadership of Ariel Dinar of the Agriculture and Natural Resources Division of the World Bank. While the final product constitutes a team effort at its best, the project is essentially his. The authors would also like to acknowledge and thank Jerome Delli Priscoli, Sandra Postel, and James Wescoat for their valuable comments in reviewing earlier drafts of this document. We are also grateful to Lili Monk for her copy-editing expertise.